

**Commission on Strategic Development
Committee on Governance and Political Development**

**Summary of discussions on the models, roadmap and timetable for
forming the Legislative Council by universal suffrage**

Introduction

As stated in the paper “Summary of discussions on the models, roadmap and timetable for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage” (Paper No: CSD/GC/5/2007), the HKSAR Government plans to publish a green paper on constitutional development (the “Green Paper”) in mid-2007 and launch a public consultation for three months. This paper aims at summarizing members’ views on the possible models, roadmap and timetable for forming the Legislative Council (“LegCo”) by universal suffrage. This will provide a basis for the HKSAR Government to prepare the Green Paper.

2. The summary of views of various organisations and individuals on possible models for forming the LegCo received by the Administration and LegCo are appended at Annex I and Annex II respectively. A summary of written submissions received by the Commission Secretariat is at Annex III.

Model for implementing universal suffrage for forming LegCo

3. At previous meetings and workshops, members discussed in detail, when universal suffrage for forming LegCo was implemented, whether functional constituency (“FC”) seats should be abolished altogether or retained in some form. However, members still had significant differences on the issue.

4. Regarding the model for forming LegCo by universal suffrage, members had reduced the scope of discussion to the following three types

of options¹:

- (a) replacing all FC seats with district-based seats returned through direct election;
- (b) retaining the FC seats in some form, but changes could be made to the electoral system so as to make the arrangements consistent with the principles of universal and equal suffrage; and
- (c) attaining universal suffrage for LegCo in phases.

Replacing all FC seats with district-based seats returned through direct election

5. Some members considered that, when universal suffrage for LegCo was implemented, all FC seats should be replaced with district-based seats returned through direct election, so as to enable all voters to enjoy universal and equal voting rights. Any electoral systems which would confer special rights on FCs to nominate candidates or to vote would not be consistent with the principle of universal suffrage. In this regard, specific proposals put forth by members included:

- (a) all seats to be returned by GCs through direct elections, with half of the seats returned by a “single-seat-single-vote” system on a district basis, and the other half by a proportional representation system, under which the whole of Hong Kong would form a single constituency, i.e. “one-person-two-votes”; and
- (b) all seats to be returned by “one-person-one-vote”, such that the number of seats allocated to different political parties would be proportional to the respective number of votes they received.

¹ After detailed discussion, members agreed to set aside for the time being any further discussions on a bicameral system as an option for implementing universal suffrage.

Changing the electoral method for FC seats

6. However, some members had reservations about the proposal of replacing all FC seats with district-based seats returned through direct election. The main reason was that, given that any amendment to the electoral methods specified in the Annexes to the Basic Law would require the endorsement of a two-thirds majority of all the members of LegCo, it would not be possible, at this stage, to secure sufficient support in LegCo for a proposal to abolish all FC seats. On the contrary, they considered it worthwhile to retain the FC seats for the following reasons:

- (a) FCs had been playing an important role in LegCo and in society. In particular, they had brought the voices of the business and professional sectors into LegCo and had, through their expertise, assisted LegCo in carrying out its legislative function and in monitoring the Government's work. FC members had made contributions to the community;
- (b) FCs could meet the interests of different sectors of society, which was consistent with the principle of "balanced participation"; and
- (c) abolishing FCs altogether was bound to meet with objections from among different sectors of the community, and it would be difficult to reach consensus on the issue.

7. Some members proposed that, when universal suffrage was implemented for LegCo, the FC seats should be retained in some form. However, changes could be made to the electoral system, so as to make the arrangements consistent with the principles of universal and equal suffrage. Members discussed various options as to how FC seats could be retained in some form when universal suffrage was implemented:

- (a) enable voters who were currently not included in FCs to vote in FCs. In other words, each voter would elect LegCo Members on the basis of "one-person-two-votes": one vote to return directly-elected GC Members, and the other to return FC Members.

Those members who supported this proposal considered that, as long as every voter would be entitled to vote for FC Members, the principles of universal and equal suffrage would be complied with.

However, some members considered that under this kind of proposals, there would be very significant disparity in the number of voters among different FCs, leading to inequality in the “value” of each vote. However, other members pointed out that even for universal suffrage which was implemented on the basis of GC elections, it would not be possible for each vote to carry the same “value”.

- (b) allow FCs to nominate candidates for election by all voters through “one-person-multiple-votes”, i.e. one vote to return directly-elected GC Members, and multiple votes to return FC Members.

Those members who supported the proposal considered that this could help ensure the candidates would not only look after the interests of individual sectors, but would also strive to gain the support of the community at large. This would be consistent with the principles of universal suffrage and “balanced participation”, and would be conducive to maintaining the long-term prosperity and stability of Hong Kong.

However, some members pointed out that this proposal would require further consideration. For example, if each voter could cast one vote to return directly-elected GC members and multiple votes to return 30 FC Members, this would mean that each voter would have 31 votes. The voting system might be too complicated for voters. Moreover, the proposal would restrict voters’ right to nominate, which could not be regarded as being consistent with the principles of “universal” and “equal” suffrage.

Attaining universal suffrage for LegCo in phases

8. Although members held diverse views on models for forming LegCo by universal suffrage, they agreed that, in taking forward Hong Kong's constitutional development, we would have to face the political reality that 30 out of the 60 LegCo seats were returned by FCs. As any amendment to the electoral method for forming LegCo would require the endorsement of a two-thirds majority of all the members of LegCo, in practice, this meant that the endorsement and support of members returned by FCs as well as those returned by GCs through direct elections would be required.

9. On the premise set out above, members considered carefully whether universal suffrage for LegCo should be implemented in phases, so that the arrangements would be more easily accepted by members of some sectors.

10. Members put forth the following specific proposals regarding the transitional arrangement:

- (a) to expand the electorate base of FCs, and replace corporate voting by individual voting;
- (b) to abolish or merge some of the existing FCs;
- (c) to return directly-elected Members from GCs and, at the same time, to allow FCs to nominate candidates for election by universal suffrage;
- (d) to abolish the FC seats in phases. However, some members considered that this would lead to disputes on which FCs should be abolished first. The problem would not be easy to resolve and the proposal might not receive two-thirds majority support from LegCo; and
- (e) to increase the proportion of district-based seats to FC seats. For example, some members suggested that consideration could be given to increasing the number of GC seats, and at the same time also increase the number of LegCo seats returned by members of District Councils

electing amongst themselves.

11. Regarding the transitional arrangement mentioned in paragraph 10(e) above, there were suggestions that it could be regarded as a model for implementing universal suffrage, i.e. all LegCo seats would be district-based seats returned through direct and indirect elections. However, members did not have in-depth discussion on this universal suffrage option.

Roadmap and timetable for forming LegCo by universal suffrage

12. Members still had significant differences on the model for forming LegCo by universal suffrage. To determine the roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage for LegCo, the major considerations would be whether:

- (a) universal suffrage for the CE should precede that for LegCo;
- (b) universal suffrage for LegCo should be attained in one go or in phases.

13. Quite a number of members agreed that consideration should be given to the direction of “resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones” in taking forward constitutional development, and that universal suffrage for the CE should be implemented first. However, some members considered that “dual universal suffrage” should be implemented in 2012, i.e. attaining universal suffrage for CE and LegCo in one go in 2012.

14. Also, some members proposed attaining universal suffrage for LegCo in phases, for example, a member suggested that the FC seats should be phased out in three LegCo terms starting from 2016.

Conclusions

15. To conclude, members’ previous discussions on the models, roadmap and timetable for forming the LegCo by universal suffrage are summarized below:

- (a) members generally agreed that, when universal suffrage was attained, the FC seats could not continue to be returned by the existing electoral method;
- (b) members had not formed any mainstream views on whether all FC seats should be replaced with district-based seats returned through direct election, or whether the electoral methods for FC seats should be changed;
- (c) quite a number of members agreed that consideration should be given to the direction of “resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones” in taking forward constitutional development, and that universal suffrage for the CE should precede that for LegCo; and
- (d) members had not formed any mainstream views on whether universal suffrage for LegCo should be attained in one go, or in phases.

Constitutional Affairs Bureau
June 2007

**Public views on possible models for
forming the Legislative Council by universal suffrage**

Written submissions received by the Government

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Mr Eric K C LI	4.1.2004	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• First phase: add 30 more geographically elected seats and maintain 30 functional constituency (FC) seats.• Second phase: turn the 30 FC seats into nominating committees. Each nominating committee to select no more than three candidates who must then obtain the mandate from the people of Hong Kong in a universally held direct election.• Final phase: all 90 seats open for universal suffrage.
Hong Kong Civic Association	12.1.2004	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• To consider a bicameral legislature consisting of a House of Representatives (i.e. Lower House) and a Senate (i.e. Upper House).• The House of Representatives could be elected on a geographical constituency (GC) basis, at a ratio of one representative for every 120,000 to 150,000 residents, for a 4-year term of office.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Senate could have between 40-50 members, about one-quarter of whom would come from the District Councils. The rest of the Senate seats should be apportioned among different sectors, such as commerce and industry, labour, education, culture, medical and social welfare etc. The term of office could be between 4 to 6 years, with half of the Senate seats coming up for election every 2-3 years.
Article 45 Concern Group	28.1.2004	The inequities in the current system of FCs are legion. The consequence of these defects in the structure is that the HKSAR Government is out of touch with the citizens. Must reflect to the Central People's Government the positive consequences if a change to universal suffrage is allowed.
The Frontier	29.1.2004	The future development of the political system is already prescribed clearly and in detail in the Basic Law. Article 68(2) provides that "The method for forming the LegCo shall be specified in the light of the actual situation in the HKSAR and in accordance with the principle of gradual and orderly progress. The ultimate aim is the election of all the members of the LegCo by universal suffrage."

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Hong Kong Democratic Foundation and Power for Democracy	13.2.2004	All seats in LegCo should be directly elected. If this ultimate goal is to be delayed, then transitional arrangements should be considered by the Administration, including proposals such as increasing the number of directly-elected seats and reducing the number of FC seats, increasing the number of directly-elected seats only, or increasing the number of both directly-elected and FC seats, or establishing a two-chamber system.
SynergyNet	13.2.2004	<p>The number of LegCo seats should be increased to 90. All Members should be elected by universal suffrage through three different ways to achieve balanced representation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) 30 members to be directly elected from single-seat GCs, using the "first past the post" principle. (ii) 30 members to be directly elected on a regional single-list system. There will be three regions - namely Hong Kong Island, Kowloon and the New Territories. Seats will be allocated on the basis of the percentage of votes received by each list. The number of seats in each region will be dependent on the population of the region.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<p>(iii) 30 members to come from designated functional sectors (similar to the existing FCs) to be elected by universal suffrage. This can be done in two ways:</p> <p>(a) turn all FCs into “occupational constituencies” so that each member of the public will belong to one of these constituencies and can take part in the election of his functional/occupational representative; or</p> <p>(b) nomination of candidates by recognized bodies of the designated functional sectors (such as business and commerce chambers, trade unions and professional societies); election by universal suffrage.</p>
Democratic Party	25.5.2004	<p>All LegCo Members should be returned by universal suffrage. It is proposed that a mixed system of a “single seat single vote system” and a “proportional representation system” be adopted. The 60 LegCo seats will be divided into two groups. The first group (with 30 seats) will be returned by a “single seat single vote system”. The whole of Hong Kong will be divided into 30 constituencies based on population ratio. Another group of seats will be returned by a proportional</p>

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

representation system. The whole of Hong Kong will form a single constituency. In other words, each voter will have two votes for electing LegCo Members.

Hon Rita FAN

27.9.2004

- The current arrangement under which Members are returned by FCs can be replaced by a new arrangement under which Members will be nominated by the constituents of the FCs and elected by universal suffrage. This can be done over three phases.
- Candidates who are nominated by FCs to participate in election by universal suffrage should be nominated by at least one-third of the electors in the respective sector.

Hong Kong University
Graduates Association
Political Reform
Concern Group

9.2004

- First phase: every eligible GC elector should have voting right in FC elections. Add a “general FC seat” under which all GC electors, whose occupations or professions are not included in other FCs, can be registered as electors.
- Second and final phase: reduce the number of FC seats to less than one-fourth, and ultimately change all FC seats to GC directly elected seats.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip	15.10.2004	Abolish LegCo FC seats. Increase the number of seats to 90. The whole of Hong Kong to be divided into 45 GCs, with two seats in each GC. Every voter can cast two votes for two candidates. The two candidates receiving the highest number of votes in a constituency will be elected.
Joint Committee for the Promotion of the Basic Law of Hong Kong	21.10.2004	Elect FC members by “one person, one vote”.
Dr Simon N M YOUNG	1.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All LegCo Members to be elected by way of direct elections on the basis of GCs. • From amongst the elected legislators, a sub-group will be further elected on the basis of FCs. The FCs will be based on policy areas. The elected FC legislators could serve as the chairpersons of LegCo Panels, and would also have a role to play in the executive apparatus of government. For example, the new FC legislators must be given a seat in the Executive Council, even if it is only a non-voting one.
Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People’s Livelihood	23.3.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Only by abolishing the FC seats in the LegCo can implementation of universal suffrage fulfill the principles of balanced participation and gradual and orderly progress.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Liberal Party	31.5.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In accordance with the Basic Law, the method for forming the LegCo shall be specified in the light of the actual situation in Hong Kong and in accordance with the principle of gradual and orderly progress. The ultimate aim is the election of all the Members of the LegCo by universal suffrage. However, FC Members' contributions to the LegCo and the Hong Kong community should not be brushed aside. • At present, the number of Members returned by FCs is equal to that of directly elected members. They serve to complement each other. We need to be cautious if this balanced situation is to be changed. There is a suggestion in the community that a bicameral system should be introduced. This suggestion merits consideration by the Administration.
The Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	31.5.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • With regard to constitutional development after 2008, it is proposed that favourable conditions should be actively created with a view to achieving the ultimate aim of forming the LegCo by universal suffrage as stipulated in the Basic Law as early as possible.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Business and Professionals Federation of Hong Kong	19.8.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="916 400 1449 613">• The first chamber to be constituted by directly elected members, and the second chamber for the vocational or functional representatives. <li data-bbox="916 663 1449 913">• The number of directly elected members in the first chamber to be increased from 30 to 40 or more. The number of functional representatives may also need to be increased. <li data-bbox="916 963 1449 1429">• The second chamber is a place to allow for second thoughts to be given to bills and motions passed by the first chamber, to give careful scrutiny, to appoint an expert committee, to seek wider consultation, if necessary to propose amendments to legislation and then to refer the findings of the deliberations to the first chamber. <li data-bbox="916 1478 1449 1861">• A lack of agreement between the two chambers can be dealt with by giving the second chamber the power to delay the passage of bills or motions, by appointing a joint committee of both chambers, or by providing for bills to shuttle between both chambers until agreement is reached. <li data-bbox="916 1910 1449 1991">• Adoption of a bicameral system would amount to gradual and

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
City University of Hong Kong Students' Union	14.8.2006	<p data-bbox="916 405 1449 483">orderly progress towards greater democracy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="855 533 1449 869">• While the principle of equal suffrage and the system of “one person, one vote” should be promoted, there should also be an interim proposal to gradually enhance the representativeness of the legislature and to limit the political power of FC Members. <li data-bbox="855 925 1449 1126">• As a transitional arrangement, the number of directly elected seats in 2012 could be increased from 30 to 40, while the number of FC seats shall remain unchanged. <li data-bbox="855 1182 1449 1731">• LegCo procedures for voting can be reformed in two ways. Firstly, the bicameral voting system should be abolished. Secondly, the political roles of FCs should be redefined. With reference to a bicameral system, FCs can play the role of an upper house. Through the power to delay passage of bills, they can provide checks and balances to a lower house constituted by directly elected members. <li data-bbox="855 1787 1449 1986">• If a bicameral system is to be further developed, FCs should undergo further reforms e.g. certain FCs of exceptionally small size should be abolished; members

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Hong Kong Democratic Foundation	16.8.2006	<p>returned by universal suffrage and some appointed members could be included in the upper house. It is envisaged that FC seats in the second chamber will gradually be replaced by directly elected seats and all seats will eventually be returned by universal suffrage.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structural reforms of the LegCo: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>Option 1</u> Increasing the number of directly elected members and FC members proportionately. <u>Option 2</u> Adopting two houses with a fully directly-elected lower house. <u>Option 3</u> Reforming the FCs, including (1) widening the franchise of electors eligible to vote for their functional representatives; (2) enlarging the number of electors beyond those executive committee members in corporate organizations eligible to vote in FC elections; and (3) co-opting new functional groups, particularly women groups, ethnic minorities and youth organizations that are relatively under-represented in the existing LegCo etc.

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

Option 4

Abolishing FCs. The option of abolishing the FCs will perhaps be politically acceptable to the vested interest groups in the event that a bicameral system is adopted.

Option 5

Maintaining the number of LegCo Members at 60 but fully democratizing the election of FC representatives (i.e. to maintain the existing 30 directly elected representatives through GCs while democratizing the elections of the FC representatives to the fullest extent). This means that FC groups can nominate representatives to run in territory-wide direct elections. After the nomination process, the candidates will compete in territory-wide elections in which each citizen will have two votes, one vote for a representative in his or her GC and the other vote for another representative in his or her occupational sector. In this way, democratization of the entire LegCo will be in conformity with the Basic Law principle of achieving universal suffrage for the whole legislative body. While FCs will be maintained, their electoral method will be democratized to the fullest extent.

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

- The two houses system, or the bicameral model, can be viewed not necessarily as the final product of democratization, but as an interim solution. The following structural reforms can be considered if a bicameral model is to be adopted:

Option 1

A wholly directly-elected 60-member LegCo (Lower House) and a newly created 60-member upper house.

The composition of the upper house: (1) all the existing FCs in the legislature and also new functional sectors such as women, youth and ethnic minorities. Furthermore, some existing FCs can be augmented, such as allocating more upper house seats to the labour groups; (2) members from not only FCs but also Hong Kong deputies to the National People's Congress, Hong Kong members of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference, and other former politicians of the HKSAR.

Option 2

Introducing a smaller upper house (30 seats) comprising the existing and the newly added FCs, and a fully directly-elected 60-member

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Representatives from the Executive Committee of the Hong Kong University Students' Union	16.8.2006	<p data-bbox="916 405 1107 443">lower house.</p> <ul data-bbox="855 488 1466 1084" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="855 488 1466 1003">• Adopting a bicameral system in Hong Kong is not without merits. The composition of the upper house can be adjusted according to the actual situation. A bicameral system is to protect vulnerable groups whose fundamental interests are hampered (and not to protect vested interests). Hence, the existing FCs in their present form should not be incorporated into the upper house. <li data-bbox="855 1048 1166 1084">• Election method <p data-bbox="916 1133 1123 1171"><u>Lower House</u></p> <p data-bbox="916 1178 1466 1429">Comprising members returned by GCs through direct elections; may review the delineation of the constituencies and the number of seats in each of the constituencies as appropriate.</p> <p data-bbox="916 1480 1466 1821">Retaining the proportional representation system. Further, an open-list proportional representation system can be adopted so that voters will not be affected by the ranking of candidates on the list pre-determined by political parties.</p> <p data-bbox="916 1872 1118 1910"><u>Upper House</u></p> <p data-bbox="916 1917 1466 1986">Members of the upper house can be elected by District Council</p>

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
The Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong (DAB's Expectations of the 2006/07 Policy Address)	18.8.2006	elected members or through a territory-wide election. May add some new seats representing the grassroot sectors.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Functions and responsibilities of the two houses: the power of the upper house and its number of seats must be less than that of the lower house. • If a bicameral system is not supported by the public after thorough discussions, it will be desirable and indeed necessary to adopt a fully directly-elected LegCo, to abolish the FCs, and to restore the normal functions of the legislature.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Given the present political environment and the level of socio-economic development of Hong Kong, we should promote the approaches of “formulating a roadmap before a timetable” and “resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones”. By “formulating a roadmap before a timetable”, we should first formulate the ultimate models of the two elections by universal suffrage, then draw up a phased plan leading to that ultimate aim, and finally work out a timetable based on the actual situation. By “resolving the simple issues before

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

the difficult ones”, universal suffrage for the CE can be implemented first. Thereafter, according to the actual situation, we can reform the method for forming the LegCo as well as its procedure of voting in two or three stages, and finally implement universal suffrage for the LegCo.

- Moving towards universal suffrage in this direction will be conducive to enhancing the legitimacy of the CE and realizing the principle of an executive-led system as stipulated in the Basic Law. Furthermore, with the experience gained from selecting the CE by universal suffrage, this will create favourable conditions for implementing universal suffrage for the LegCo, facilitate the public in forging consensus and thus turning a new page in constitutional development.
- We should actively create favourable conditions for constitutional development, including accelerating the economic integration of Hong Kong and the Mainland so as to build a solid economic foundation for constitutional development; nurturing political talents; and strengthening national education to promote Hong Kong people's

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		understanding of the concept of “one country” and the Basic Law. Hence, the aim of attaining universal suffrage as stipulated in the Basic Law can be achieved as early as possible.
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing (Proposals for the Policy Address)	21.8.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To abolish FCs as soon as possible and elect all LegCo Members on the basis of “one person, one vote”. • If FCs cannot be abolished at once, at least company/corporate votes should be abolished and the electorate base for the FCs should be expanded to allow more members of the public to participate in the election.
The Hong Kong Social Workers Association (Views on the 2006 Policy Address)	29.8.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To formulate a timetable for implementing universal suffrage for the two elections and elect all LegCo Members by universal suffrage as soon as possible. • Before all LegCo Members are elected by universal suffrage, broaden the electorate base of FC elections.
The Civic Party (Civic Party’s Policy Expectations of the SAR Government)	31.8.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hong Kong has long acquired the conditions for implementing universal suffrage for the two elections. Democratic elections by equal and universal suffrage are the basic conditions for any city

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<p>which claims to be an “international city”.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The CE has tasked the Commission on Strategic Development, with all of its members appointed, as the main platform to discuss a roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage. However, the conclusions of the Commission cannot replace the views of the public. The Policy Address to be delivered in October should announce an immediate commencement of a public consultation exercise on the issue.
Democratic Party (Submitted at the consultation session on the 2006/07 Policy Address)	4.9.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Propose to adopt a mixed system of a “single seat single vote system” and a “proportional representation system”. Each voter will have two votes for electing all LegCo Members. • Object to the proposal of implementing a bicameral system in order to preserve the FCs.
Ms Regina IP LAU Suk-yee	9.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The principles of “balanced representation” and “facilitation of a capitalist economy” can be preserved by the HKSAR adopting a mixed system. • A mixed system means seats in LegCo may be divided into two categories:

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Civic Exchange	21.11.2006	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Seats in multi-member GCs which may be returned by elections in the districts as at present, and seats to be filled by candidates on a party list; 2) Each voter may be given two votes: a vote in a GC and a vote for a candidate from the party list. In both categories, the number of candidates from each party will depend on the number of votes cast for candidates on a party list. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Such a mixed system, which may be called “parallel geographical-party list” system, would have the advantage of enabling two categories of candidates, those who focus on representation of local interests in GCs, and those who focus on broader, Hong Kong-wide issues to stand for elections.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To retain FC as they are will likely reinforce public suspicions that the current political system unfairly favours certain groups, particularly business interests. • Bicameralism has been proposed as a possible solution. We believe this concept has not been fully explored.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Kowloon Federation of Associations	4.12.2006 10.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="855 405 1449 786">• If the HKSARG is willing to be frank with the people of Hong Kong on the necessity to retain FCs and to show a genuine openness in examining how the FC election system can be overhauled, it may well lead to the possibility of moving the constitutional development debate forward. <li data-bbox="855 835 1449 1171">• Should first handle the issue of selecting the CE by universal suffrage. With the experience and insight gained from implementing universal suffrage for the CE, it would be a practical way to implement universal suffrage for LegCo afterwards.
Mrs Anson Chan and her core group	5.3.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="855 1223 1449 1480">• There is no doubt that the Hong Kong community is politically mature enough for election of all members of LegCo, on the basis of universal suffrage, to be introduced smoothly in 2012. <li data-bbox="855 1529 1449 1942">• If, for whatever reason, it is decided that universal suffrage will not be introduced in 2012, then it is considered that Hong Kong people must be given an assurance, at the earliest opportunity, that it will be achieved no later than the following round of LegCo elections in 2016.

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

- It is important to make some gradual and orderly progress in the next round of elections in 2008, include refining corporate voting to encompass all members of the Boards of Directors, Executive and/or Management Committees of those companies, associations and organizations which currently exercise a single corporate vote. If this measure is implemented, it is estimated that the overall number of eligible voters for Functional Constituencies will increase from the current 215,551 to approximately 450,000.
- Recommend that the existing Functional Constituencies be organized into 10 groups. This will strengthen the mandate and representativeness of those elected:

Group	Functional Constituencies Included	No. of Seats
1	Commercial (First), Commercial (Second), Import & Export and Wholesale & Retail	4
2	Agriculture & Fisheries, Industrial (First), Industrial (Second) and Textiles & Garment	4

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>	
	3	Catering, Tourism and Transport	3
	4	Insurance, Finance, Financial Services and Information Technology	4
	5	Accountancy and Legal	2
	6	Architectural, Surveying & Planning, Engineering and Real Estate & Construction	3
	7	Education	1
	8	Labour	3
	9	Health Services, Medical and Social Welfare	3
	10	District Council, Heung Yee Kuk and Sports, Performing Arts, Culture & Publication	3
		Total	30

- If it is decided not to introduce universal suffrage in 2012, it is proposed that the 10 electoral groupings be further combined to form no more than three large groups for voting purpose, and that the number of FC seats be reduced by 50% to 15:

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>												
		<table> <tr> <th data-bbox="879 409 963 443">Group</th><th data-bbox="1011 409 1203 533">Functional Constituencies Included</th><th data-bbox="1345 409 1430 488">No. of Seats</th></tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="927 600 943 633">1</td><td data-bbox="1011 600 1305 678">Industrial, commercial and financial sectors</td><td data-bbox="1377 600 1393 633">5</td></tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="927 696 943 730">2</td><td data-bbox="1011 696 1219 730">The professions</td><td data-bbox="1377 696 1393 730">5</td></tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="927 748 943 781">3</td><td data-bbox="1011 748 1299 871">Labour, social services, religious and other sectors</td><td data-bbox="1377 748 1393 781">5</td></tr> </table>	Group	Functional Constituencies Included	No. of Seats	1	Industrial, commercial and financial sectors	5	2	The professions	5	3	Labour, social services, religious and other sectors	5
Group	Functional Constituencies Included	No. of Seats												
1	Industrial, commercial and financial sectors	5												
2	The professions	5												
3	Labour, social services, religious and other sectors	5												
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The balance of 15 seats, vacated by Functional Constituency members would be converted into directly elected geographical seats thus paving the way for the complete phasing out of Functional Constituencies in 2016. 												
22 LegCo Members	27.3.2007	Adopt a mixed system in the 2012 LegCo election. Half of the LegCo seats to be returned by simple majority system on the basis of “single-seat-single-vote”; the other half to be returned by proportional representation system. The whole of Hong Kong will be a single constituency. Each voter would have two votes.												
Dr Dixon Sing Ming	3.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> LegCo shall be divided into two houses: Upper House and Lower House. Lower House shall be comprised of 76 members. All seats shall be 												

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

elected by universal suffrage.

- The composition of Upper House:
 - (a) 40% for reformed functional constituencies.
 - (b) 40% from representatives elected by directly elected district council members.
 - (c) 20% are appointed members.
 - (d) There shall be in total 62 members.
- In electing Upper House members, the functional constituency shall employ “first past the post” mechanism, while representatives of directly elected district council members shall be elected by the open list in proportional representation.
- Seats of Lower House shall be elected by way of mixed plurality principle. A single, Hong Kong-wide, closed list-tier using proportional representation will be used to elect two-thirds of the seats in Hong Kong’s Lower House. The remaining one-third seats in the Lower House, chosen by majoritarian elections, should be elected by double-seat constituencies, using a double-vote electoral system.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Hong Kong Citizen (without signature)	8.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Each voter may have four votes, two for GCs universal suffrage election and the other two for FCs universal suffrage election. • 30 district-based seats will be allocated to five districts according to existing practice. Each voter can cast two votes, one for a candidate (or the list of candidates) within the district and the other one for a candidate (or the list of candidates) outside the district. However, voters may not cast two votes for the same candidate or the same candidate list. Adopt a “proportional representation system” to standardise the method of determining the results across the territory in the form of lists of candidates. • There will be 30 FC seats covering the whole territory. Each voter may cast two votes, one for a candidate within the group (lists of candidates are not applicable) and the other one for a candidate outside the group (lists of candidates are not applicable). However, voters may not cast two votes for the same candidate. Adopt the “simple majority system” to determine the results and the 30 candidates receiving the highest

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

number of votes will be elected.

- The number of eligible voters of each functional body cannot be too small and 15 000 voters may be used as a reference. Sectors which have inadequate number of voters would need to merge with other sectors or undergo reorganisation in order to meet the requirement. Moreover, a substantial number of representatives have to be appointed through each functional body with a view to meeting the target. Abolish FC seats in district councils (this is an overlap with GC election) to allow wider participation of functional bodies.

Hong Kong Civic
Association

10.4.2007
3.5.2007
5.2007

2008 LegCo elections

- Corporate voting in the FCs should be redefined to encompass all members of the Boards of Directors and Executive and/or Management Committees of those companies.

2012 LegCo elections

- The introduction of a bicameral system can enhance the sustainable economic and social development of Hong Kong. As such, the system, as a feasible option, should not be rejected.

Organizations/
individuals
making the submissions

Date of
Submission

Summary of Views

- Add 10 more LegCo seats and five more seats each in GCs and the District Council FC.
- To combine the existing relatively narrow-based FCs into several functional bodies so as to reduce the number of FCs and have a larger one-man-one-vote base. The number of FCs should be below 15. Suggest introducing a representative nominating committee to prepare a list of candidates.
- In the 2012 LegCo elections, the arrangement of half of its members returned by GCs through direct elections and half by FCs should be maintained.
- Each voter will have two votes, one vote for a representative in his or her GC and the other vote for another representative in his or her occupational sector.

2016 LegCo Elections

- No recommendations can be made at this stage as to whether all LegCo seats should be elected by universal suffrage in 2016.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Mr WONG Hok-kut, President, Asia-Pacific Institute of International Relations	10.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is the general trend to remove all seats from functional constituencies in LegCo, which is also in line with the people-based principle of a civil society. • The proposal is to gradually reduce and remove the seats from functional constituencies by three phases. Merging related functional constituencies to reduce 10 seats in 2012 and a further reduction of 10 seats in 2016, followed by the removal of the remaining 10 seats in 2020 when all 60 seats will be elected by universal suffrage. • Increasing the number of geographical constituencies in 2012 from 6 to 8, including Hong Kong Island North, Hong Kong Island South, Kowloon East, Kowloon West, New Territories East, New Territories West, New Territories North and New Territories South. Seats will be allocated to each constituency pro rata based on population while proportional representation will continue to be adopted. • It should be expressly stipulated that a permanent resident of Hong Kong must also be a Chinese citizen before he/she acquires the rights to vote and stand for election. Moreover, it is necessary

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		to remove the provision that allows LegCo Members to possess foreign nationality.
Mr CHIM Ming (transliteration)	10.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hong Kong has already had a bicameral system in practice, with the Executive Council serving as the counterpart of the British House of Lords and the Legislative Council as the counterpart of the British House of Commons. We only need to bring members of functional constituencies into the Executive Council.
Basic Law Institute	11.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Suggests maintaining 60 LegCo seats in 2012, 30 to be returned by direct election through geographical constituencies, and the other 30 returned through functional constituency. Introduce institutional innovation into the current 30 functional constituency seats. In 2012, 10 seats (one-third) will be nominated by functional constituencies for election as LegCo members on a one-person-one-vote basis; in 2016, another 10 seats will be nominated in the same way for election as LegCo members on a one-person-one-vote basis; finally, in 2020, the remaining 10 seats will be nominated in the

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<p>same way for election as LegCo members on a one-person-one-vote basis.</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When situation allows, i.e. when the operation of local political parties has become mature, the distinction between directly-elected geographical seats and functional constituency seats should be abolished and the ultimate aim of election of all members of the Legislative Council by universal suffrage should be achieved.
New Century Forum	12.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gradual abolition of FC seats. Abolition of FC seats within eight years is suggested. • LegCo seats to be increased to 70 in 2008. Five additional seats respectively for GCs through direct election and FCs. All five new FC seats are added to the District Council FC. • LegCo seats to be increased to 80 in 2012. Five additional seats respectively for GCs through direct election and FCs. All five new FC seats to be added to District Council FC, i.e. District Council FC seats to be increased to 11. To abolish bicameral voting arrangement at LegCo.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Mr CHOI Yeung-chi	12.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Abolition of all LegCo FC seats in 2016. Number of seats to be maintained at 80, all of which to be returned by direct election through GCs. 30 seats respectively for FCs and GCs. <u>FCs</u>: The top 30 FC candidates with the best rate are elected. The best rate refers to that of the FC candidates who receive the highest number of votes against all registered electors (instead of the electors who cast the votes) for that particular FC. No by-election. Vacancies are filled by the 31st candidate in line of succession and so on. No one will be elected uncontested. Voting is still required for the FC with only one candidate. <u>GC</u>: Territory-wide GC voting: the top 30 with the highest votes are elected. No by-election. Vacancies are filled by the 31st candidate in line of succession and so on.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Hong Kong Policy Research Institute	18.4.2007 9.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Electors' votes and voting rights:</u> Electors may have more than one voting right but as electors, they are entitled to cast one vote only. In other words, when they vote, they have to decide to cast which vote (including the FC vote and the GC vote) rather than casting one vote for the FC and one for the GC.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The 2008 LegCo Election should adopt the same electoral method as that for the last LegCo Election, i.e. 30 seats returned by geographical constituencies (GCs) through direct election and 30 seats by functional constituencies (FCs).
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To abolish all the 30 FCs and implement universal suffrage in 2012. • If, for whatever reasons, it is decided that universal suffrage will not be introduced for LegCo Election in 2012, the following options are suggested for consideration: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 30 members be returned by proportional representation system; 2. 30 members to come from designated FCs, but the electorate base for some FCs

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Name provided (the sender requested anonymity)	30.4.2007	<p>should be expanded;</p> <p>3. Under this option, if those eligible to vote in FC elections choose to vote for FC members, they have to give up their chance to vote in the GC elections.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Voters should have equal suffrage and they should at least be entitled to cast the same number of votes. • 2008 LegCo Election <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) No need to change the arrangement for GC elections by universal suffrage. (b) To abolish all corporate votes and replace them by individual votes in all FC elections. (c) To merge 17 existing sectors into 10. (d) The delineation of FCs enables people in the professional sectors to participate in politics. Hence, the existing definition of FC should be retained and only graduates from universities/ tertiary institutions can register as voters for these sectors. To add one seat for the “emerging and others” sector, ensuring that people with professional qualifications but not covered by other sectors can stand for

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<p>and vote in elections.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To add one seat for the labour sector (3 seats at present) and abolish trade union votes. • Only District Councillors from 5 major constituencies can compete for the 5 seats in the social service sector. Voters are those who are not working. • Emerging and others: This additional seat is provided for those eligible Hong Kong residents (including some religious people and ethnic minorities, etc.) who are aged 18 and cannot stand for or vote in any FC election. • All eligible voters in Hong Kong should have the second vote.
Democratic Party	3.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Abolish FCs and adopt a mixed electoral system in the 2012 LegCo election. Half of the LegCo seats to be returned by simple majority system on the basis of “single-seat-single-vote”; the other half to be returned by proportional representation system under which the whole of Hong Kong will form a single constituency. Each voter will have two votes.
Mr LAI Chi Lap, Albert	4.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is only one model of universal suffrage: referendum.

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Mr WONG Kam-din	8.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="855 454 1449 530">• The LegCo FC seats must be abolished. <li data-bbox="855 584 1449 750">• Acceptable social consensus on the model of “universal suffrage” should be reached before deciding on the roadmap and the timetable. <li data-bbox="855 806 1449 1055">• The models for electing the CE and forming the LegCo by universal suffrage may not be the same as the CE and the LegCo are representing different political entities. <li data-bbox="855 1111 1449 1619">• Propose to maintain the existing LegCo FCs but abolish the company votes and corporate votes, which are to be replaced by director’s individual votes and executive’s individual votes, from 2012. In a LegCo election, those entitled to the individual votes of FCs may choose to vote in either the FCs or the GCs through direct election. Each of these voters shall cast only one vote. <li data-bbox="855 1675 1449 1968">• Set up a “committee on the review of the functional constituencies of the Legislative Council” which shall regularly review “the formation, functions and members’ performance of the functional constituencies of the Legislative

<u>Organizations/ individuals making the submissions</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		Council” and submit reports on the review.
38 th Student Union of Chu Hai College of Higher Education	10.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the direct election of the GCs, “balanced participation” is realised with one person having one vote. However, for the FCs, some people such as the students, housewives, etc. do not have the votes. • The Government should abolish the bicameral voting system immediately and expand the electorate base of the FCs in 2008. In 2012, the LegCo should be formed by universal suffrage in order to plug the loophole of the “bicameral voting system” and to address the people’s request.
Mr Henry WOO	8.6.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintaining the current functional constituency system with multiple sectors and layers should be a feasible option to perform its "check and balance" role on the future CE elected by universal suffrage.

**Public views on possible models for
forming the Legislative Council by universal suffrage**

Written submissions received by the Legislative Council

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Dr Anthony B L CHEUNG (Submission No. 15 in Appendix II to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01))	27.1.2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ways to move to a democratically elected LegCo –<ul style="list-style-type: none">(a) all 60 LegCo seats to be directly elected on a GC basis; or(b) 30 seats to be directly elected on a GC basis and the remaining 30 on a territory-wide single-list system so as to achieve mixed representation of local and territory-wide interests; or(c) 30 seats to be directly elected on a GC basis and 30 FC seats on a universal franchise basis (each voter is eligible to vote in one GC and one FC).• To allay concerns of the business and professional sectors about direct election, the number of LegCo seats

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		can be increased to, say, 100 or 120 to provide greater chance for elite members of the community to be elected to LegCo under the proportional representation voting system.
Mr KY SHAW (Submission No. 18 in Appendix II to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01))	14.2.2000	LegCo Members to be elected on a GC basis. The delineation of GC boundaries is open to discussion, and the number of seats in a GC should be in direct proportion to the population of the GC.
Association for the Advancement of Feminism (Submission No. 14 in Appendix II to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01))	9.11.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Abolish FCs. • All Members to be elected by way of direct elections on the basis of GCs.
Hong Kong Christian Institute (Submission No. 17 in Appendix II to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01))	12.11.2005	All 60 Members to be returned by GCs under a “one person, one vote” and a simple majority system.
Shatin Tertiary Students’ Association (Submission No. 20 in Appendix II to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01))	12.11.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explore the possibility of implementing a bicameral legislature. • Universal suffrage could take the form of direct or indirect election.

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(11))	9.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Constitutional development should be pursued without invoking a constitutional crisis and amending the Basic Law. • The model for universal suffrage should comply with the provisions of the Basic Law and four principles on constitutional development, namely (1) meeting the interests of different sectors of society; (2) facilitating the development of the capitalist economy; (3) gradual and orderly progress; and (4) appropriate to the actual situation in Hong Kong.
Ms LEE Kwai-chun (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(07))	10.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To tie in with the enhanced role and functions of the District Councils, support to increase District Council FC seats in the 2008 LegCo Election and all these seats should be returned through election by District Council Members among themselves.
League of Social Democrats (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(09))	11.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The number of LegCo seats should be increased from 60 to 70, all of which should be returned by universal suffrage with the abolition of the existing FCs.

Organisations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. ^{Note})	Date of Submission	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An open attitude is held towards the electoral method and three options are proposed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) “Single seat, single vote” system; (b) Proportional representation system; and (c) Mixed electoral system: half of the seats to be returned by a “single seat, single vote” system, under which the whole of Hong Kong would be divided into 35 small GCs, and the other half allocated in proportion to population to five large GCs, namely Hong Kong Island (6 seats), Kowloon East (6 seats), Kowloon West (5 seats), New Territories East (8 seats) and New Territories West (10 seats) and returned by a proportional representation system.
Mr LEUNG Siu-tong (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(10))	11.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The number of seats for the 2012 LegCo Election should be increased to 72, with the number of Members returned by FCs and that by direct

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Miss Amy YUNG Wing-sheung (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(02))	15.5.2007	elections on a GC basis both raised to 36.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The number of seats for the 2016 LegCo Election can be maintained at 72, with the number of FC seats reduced to 18 and GC directly elected seats increased to 54. At the same time, the Government should re-evaluate the mechanism for electing the CE and forming the LegCo with a view to broadening the base for democracy.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To achieve universal suffrage for the 2012 LegCo Election, the abolition of the FC seats is a natural development. If we are to follow the principle of “gradual and orderly progress”, it is a reasonable step to first introduce a reform in 2008. • It is of utmost importance to expand the electorate base of FCs, and therefore company/ corporate voting should be abolished. • In 2012, all FC seats should be abolished in one go and full-scale direct elections should be implemented.

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Liberal Party (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(13))	15.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is undesirable to implement universal suffrage for both the CE and LegCo in 2012 in one go so as to avoid uncertainties in both the executive and legislative frameworks of the HKSAR simultaneously. • In the event that universal suffrage for CE election can be implemented in 2012, we could work towards the attainment of universal suffrage with regard to the LegCo FC seats could start in 2016 (i.e. the immediately following term) at the earliest. • The number of FC seats can be reduced from 30 to 20 in the first phase, and further reduced to 10 in the second phase, and finally all the seats would be returned by universal suffrage. Through this process, it is estimated that universal suffrage for the LegCo can be achieved in 2024. As for the actual pace in achieving this, continued efforts should be made to seek consensus within the community. Since traditional FCs which have expertise in economic policies such as commercial and industrial and professional

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
The Chinese Manufacturers' Association (LC Paper No. CB(2)1910/06-07(01))	17.5.2007	<p>FCs need more time to adapt to such a change, it is proposed that they can be abolished in the last phase.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> During the transitional period, the electorate base of the FCs can be expanded as appropriate by, for example, extending the company votes of the FCs to increase the number of director votes and senior executive votes. It is considered that the emergence of a favourable environment in the community is a pre-requisite for changing the existing electoral mode for the LegCo. It is proposed that universal suffrage for CE election should be implemented before that for the LegCo.
Civic Association (LC Paper No. CB(2)1910-06/07(02))	18.5.2007	<p><u>2008 LegCo elections</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Corporate voting in the FCs should be redefined, i.e. to extend the voting right from the company to all members of the Boards of Directors and Executive and/or Management Committees of those companies.

Organisations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. ^{Note})	Date of Submission	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<p><u>2012 LegCo elections</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Add 10 more LegCo seats and five more seats each in GCs and District Council FC. • To combine the existing relatively narrow-based FCs to no more than 15 as far as practicable so as to enlarge the electorate base. Such FC groups should form a nomination committee, consisting of no more than 100 members, to compile a list of eligible contenders. Electors on the electoral roll may elect their representatives. • In the five existing LegCo constituencies, District Council members may elect from among themselves a representative to the LegCo. One more seat should be allocated to each of the five LegCo constituencies. • Each voter will have two votes, one vote for a representative in his or her GC and the other vote for another representative in his or her occupational sector.

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
The Frontier	19.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FCs should be abolished as soon as possible to enable Hong Kong people to elect all LegCo Members on the basis of “one person, one vote”. The universal suffrage for the LegCo can be implemented by adopting a “single seat, single vote” system or proportional representation system. • If FCs cannot be abolished immediately, at least company/corporate votes should be abolished and the electorate base of the FCs should be expanded to allow more members of the public to participate in the election.
Civil Human Rights Front	20.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Given a mature government, well-developed supporting electoral measures and wide public participation in the election, it is believed that Hong Kong people are provided with the required conditions and rights to elect the CE and all LegCo Members of the HKSAR on the basis of “one person, one vote” so as to implement of the accountability system finally.

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
Concern Group on Hong Kong's Future	21.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Half of the seats to be directly elected from single-seat GCs, using the “first past the post” principle, and the other half allocated under a proportional representation system in order to achieve balanced participation.
The Democratic Party (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(08))	5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A mixed electoral system to be adopted for the 2012 LegCo Election, with half of the seats directly elected through a single seat single vote system on a district basis (using the simple majority system) and the other half returned by a proportional representation system, under which the whole of Hong Kong would form a single constituency. Each voter would have two votes.
Asia-Pacific Institute of International Relations (LC Paper No. CB(2)1873/06-07(12))	5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To abolish FCs in the LegCo Election in three stages: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Reduce 10 FC seats by merging related FCs in 2012; (2) Reduce 10 more FC seats by merging FCs which are related in broad term; (3) Abolish all FCs in 2020. • There are to be eight GCs for GC Election:

<u>Organisations/individuals making the submissions</u> (Submission No. ^{Note})	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u>
		<p>(1) Increase the number of GCs to 8 in 2012. These are Hong Kong Island North, Hong Kong Island South, Kowloon East, Kowloon West, New Territories East, New Territories West, New Territories North and New Territories South. Seats are allocated on the basis of the population ratio of each region.</p> <p>(2) Further increase the number of GC seats in 2016.</p> <p>(3) All 60 seats to be returned by eight GCs in 2020.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A proportional representation system to be adopted throughout.

Note: Please refer to the Legislative Council webpage for the original text of the submission (LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01)).
www.legco.gov.hk/yr05-06/english/panels/ca/papers/ca0619cb2-2386-1e.pdf)

**Written Submissions Received by
the Committee on Governance and Political Development of the
Commission on Strategic Development**

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
Miss TAM Wai-chu, Maria	29.11.2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Apart from considering the options of eliminating the FCs altogether or implementing a bicameral system, a third option could be universal suffrage with designated seats with candidates nominated by FCs.• The separate voting system now in place can be retained under this model.
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan	1.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The FC system should be abolished as soon as possible.• Before the abolition of FC elections, the Government should introduce the following two reform measures:<ul style="list-style-type: none">(a) expand the electorate base of FCs - replacing corporate votes with individual votes (for example, expanding the electorate base of the Labour FC to cover all members of the registered trade unions); and(b) review the need to retain FCs with little competition in

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		elections – consider abolishing these FCs or merging them with other FCs.
Dr LEUNG Mei-fun, Priscilla	16.1.2006	<p>In the process of developing the existing system towards the ultimate aim of universal suffrage, we may consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) gradually reducing the number of FCs, starting with turning those FCs which support universal suffrage into GC seats, and ultimately abolishing all FCs. (b) abolishing corporate votes of FCs. FC representatives should be elected by eligible voters in the respective FCs by “one person, one vote”. Voters in FCs must be clearly delineated. (c) If it is not possible to reduce the number of FCs, we may consider introducing more FCs and re-delineating the electorate of the FCs to pave way for reform e.g. adding a Chinese medicine FC, a higher education FC, an environmental protection FC, a publishing FC or any other FCs which should have been represented in the LegCo. There may even be a FC for homemakers. In the end, LegCo Members returned by FCs would be as representative as those returned by GCs through direct elections.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
Hon SHEK Lai-him, Abraham	19.1.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the light of political reality, if FCs are abolished, it would be difficult to realize a political system that can meet the interests of different sectors of society and facilitate the development of a capitalist economy. • If the design of a bicameral system can reflect the actual situation of Hong Kong and help resolve the complicated issues relating to the design of the political structure, it will be worthwhile to examine and explore this option. • In the event that a bicameral system is adopted for LegCo in future, and if members returned by FCs are to form the second chamber, the electorate base of these FCs could be expanded suitably. For example, a “one person, one vote” system could be adopted for professional sectors where voters are professionally qualified and have certain years of experience in the related trades. Moreover, the existing corporate voting system should be maintained to protect the interest of investors.
Mr CHAN Chung-bun, Bunny	20.1.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Should examine ways to retain FCs and to strengthen their roles, operation and functions. • At present, many people have not yet been included in FCs. There is a need to work out feasible arrangements

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<p>enabling the concerned people, including those who are not working such as housewives, to also have two votes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As for FC elections, all organizations should adopt an open and competitive process as far as practicable to allow all electors in the constituencies to vote for their LegCo representatives.
Mr LAU Nai Keung	1.3.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Under the principle of “gradual and orderly progress” of constitutional development, it appears that some sort of transitional arrangement is inevitable. In this regard, a bicameral system is currently discussed most. • The option of a bicameral system recognizes that certain interests of Hong Kong, including the interests of the Central Authorities in Hong Kong, require special regard on a long-term basis, and that a bicameral system should be a long-term arrangement. As such, the upper house should have more extensive veto power, which should at least cover bills relating to constitutional reform and the relationship between the Central Authorities and the SAR, private bills proposed by members of the lower house, and other important bills which currently require the endorsement of a two-third majority of the LegCo.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To achieve the ultimate aim of having all LegCo seats returned by universal suffrage, one possible method is that the seats in the upper house be nominated by the respective FCs, and be elected by “one person one vote”. This could likely avoid the need to amend the Basic Law.
Hon LEE Wing Tat	5.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All the present 30 FC seats in LegCo should be abolished and be returned by universal suffrage instead. Consideration should be given to a mixed election model combining the “single seat single vote system” and the “proportional representation system”, where all LegCo Members will be returned through elections by “one person, two votes”. Under this model, LegCo seats will be divided into two groups. The first group will be returned by a “single seat single vote system”. The whole Hong Kong will be divided into certain number of constituencies based on population ratio. Another group of seats (half of all seats) will be returned by a proportional representation system. The whole of Hong Kong will form a single constituency. In other words, each elector will have two votes for electing LegCo Members.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
---	-------------------------------	---

- Regarding the criteria for delineation of constituencies, under the proposed option, 30 LegCo Members will be returned by GCs on a “single seat single vote” basis. In other words, 30 constituencies will be delineated across the territory according to population ratio, each returning one LegCo Member.
- Apart from the population quota, it is proposed that other criteria provided for in the existing legislation should continue to be adopted. These include community identities, the preservation of local ties and physical features of the relevant areas etc. As for the existing boundaries of districts and GCs, they will need to be delineated afresh.
- On the voting system, under the proposed model, a “single seat single vote system” will be adopted for GC elections, and a “proportional representation system” adopted for the single constituency covering the whole territory. It is proposed that the “list voting system” under the “proportional representation system” should continue to be adopted, and that the election results should be determined by the largest remainder formula. Such election method is familiar to the public. Review could be conducted in future as necessary.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
Mr CHAN Chung Bun, Bunny	26.5.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As the FCs have been playing a very important role in the LegCo and in the community at large, consideration should be given to preserving their role in the legislative framework. • However, the issue seems to be that, conceptually, under a LegCo with all members returned by universal suffrage, there should no longer be any FCs. Even if we further enhance the role of FCs, the continual existence of FCs should only be temporary and the FCs should be abolished eventually. • If there is sufficient support for preserving the FCs, the direction should be that the composition and election method of the FCs should remain unchanged. Only by doing so will it be consistent with the view that FCs are indispensable. • Increasing the number of seats in the “District Council FC” for LegCo election will enhance the representativeness of the FCs as members of the District Councils are elected by all GC voters. • Another possible option is to add new LegCo FCs so that eligible voters who are currently not covered by the FCs, such as housewives, employees in business entities, persons without professional qualifications and

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<p>students having reached the voting age, will be included. The ultimate aim is that all eligible voters are covered by the FCs. Under this model, all eligible voters will have two votes each, i.e. one for a GC and one for an FC.</p>
Hon SHEK Lai-him, Abraham	22.9.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the future LegCo formed by universal suffrage, half of the seats should be allocated to FC members. • Regarding the method for returning FC Members, candidates should be nominated by voters in their respective FCs for election by universal suffrage. Candidates should be required to obtain support from at least 30% of the voters in the relevant trade to become eligible for running the election. • To abolish corporate voting cannot meet the principle of “facilitate the development of a capitalist economy”. • After implementation of universal suffrage, candidates nominated by FCs will need to stand for election on the basis of “one-person-one-vote”. Candidates will have wider legitimacy and will be able to truly represent their respective trades if corporate voting can be retained.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Since FC Members will be returned by universal suffrage, it would be meaningless to expand the electorate base of FCs. To expand the electorate base of FCs would only give rise to more disputes concerning how to determine the eligibility of voters.
Miss TAM Wai-chu, Maria	22.9.2006	A legislature with half of its members returned by GCs through direct election and half by FCs is indeed more representative. As a matter of fact, such a legislature has helped maintain Hong Kong's long term social stability and had helped ensure that the Government policies would take fuller account of the interests of different sectors. It is on this basis that the nomination right of FCs should be retained when moving towards universal suffrage.
Dr LEUNG Mei-fun, Priscilla, Prof CHENG Kwok-hon, Leonard	22.9.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On the basis of the current arrangements, there should continue to be equal number of seats for FC and GC Members. The number of seats could be increased on the same proportion. The 30 FC seats should form a separate chamber. • To introduce the concept of "one council two groups". To require separate voting by the "FC group" and the group returned by universal suffrage on passage of bills, thereby formally separating the two groups.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Through returning FC Members by universal suffrage, not only can the ultimate aim of forming LegCo by universal suffrage as stipulated in the Basic Law be achieved, the interests of the relevant trades and different sectors can also be met. FCs: <u>First Phase</u> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <u>To expand the electorate base and the constituencies</u> Once the principle that a candidate must come from his respective trade is laid down, all eligible voters can either select the candidates on the basis of “constituency”, or select the candidates by marking on the list of candidates for each FC. <u>Abolishing corporate voting in the FCs</u> FC representatives should be elected by eligible voters in the respective FCs by “one-person-one-vote”. Voters in FCs must be clearly delineated. <u>Adding more FCs</u> If it is not possible to reduce the number of FCs gradually, consideration can be given to introducing more FCs and re-delineating the electorate of the FCs to pave way for reform. Some proposed new FCs include

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<p>Chinese medicine, higher education, environmental protection, publication or any other sectors which should have been represented in the LegCo. There could even be a “comprehensive FC” to cover all those voters who are not included in any other FCs.</p> <p><u>Second Phase</u> To allow all voters to vote at FCs (i.e. voters will have one vote to return directly elected members and other votes to return all FC Members).</p> <p><u>Third Phase</u> Should only consider abolishing all FC seats and returning all seats by universal suffrage when the necessary pre-conditions are ready.</p>
Mr YU Kwok-chun	27.9.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FCs should be retained when universal suffrage is implemented; the roles and functions of FCs should be substantiated.
Ms Janie FONG	6.10.2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Models with nominated FC candidates elected by universal suffrage, along with open elections of GCs through direct elections may serve as viable solutions to ensure a certain level of stability in the policy making process with experienced and proven legislative policy leaders during the transition process.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
Dr Leung Mei-fun, Priscilla	25.1.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed bicameral system requires careful review as to whether it is legally viable and conforms to the Basic Law. • The option of returning FC Members by universal suffrage on the basis of "one-person-multi-votes" is a happy medium between bicameralism and universal suffrage. • The original option comprises three phases. In the First Phase, every voter will gain the experience of casting two votes. The principles of balanced participation and of gradual and orderly progress will be maintained throughout its development process. Only after the First Phase is fully developed will it proceed into the Second and Third phases. • The First Phase aims at expanding the electoral base. The process of expansion should be intricately designed, forbidding people to come "all of a sudden" to register as members of a sector to which they have no connection with. • "One-person-multi-votes" will be implemented in the Second Phase. Before entering the Second Phase, the issue of definition of electors of different FCs should be taken note of.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dual universal suffrage of the Third Phase may come into effect when the conditions are ripe for the implementation of universal suffrage.
Mr WONG Kong-hon	10.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserving the FCs not only meets the interests of different sectors of society, but also accords with the check-and-balance function between the executive authorities and the legislature in a way that they are able to regulate each other as well as co-ordinate their activities. Retaining the FC seats in some form is conducive to the community at large as a more balanced account of views of people from all walks, as well as different sectors and spectra of society could be taken. • A legislature with half of its members returned by GCs through direct election and half by FCs is indeed more representative. Hence, FC seats returning by universal suffrage should be retained.
Miss TAM Wai-chu, Maria	11.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preserving the FCs not only meets the interests of different sectors of society, but also accords with the check-and-balance function between the executive authorities and the legislature in a way that they are able to regulate each other as well as co-ordinate their activities.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is not desirable to change the existing requirements in respect of the qualification of FC voters. These voters should be conferred with the right to nominate or to select candidates for election by universal suffrage. • Regarding the model for implementing universal suffrage, we should not limit ourselves to the format of “one-person-one-vote”, “one-person-two-votes” or “one-person-multiple-votes”. As long as all members of the public are given universal and equal voting right, the system itself is, in essence, universal suffrage. • Better start with changing the method for electing representatives of those FCs in favour of universal suffrage, so that a broader support for the option in LegCo could be secured. • All LegCo members returned by universal suffrage must be Chinese citizens with no right of abode in any foreign country. The nationality of LegCo members should be an issue for discussion.
Hon SHEK Lai-him, Abraham	12.4.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Abolishing FC seats and forming the LegCo with all seats returned by universal suffrage will make the principle of “balanced participation” hard to realise.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposal for re-defining corporate voting for the LegCo Election in 2008 is not feasible. • The duration of the transitional period for the FCs before abolishing all FC seats and having all LegCo seats returned by universal suffrage in 2012 is inadequate. • If a consensus on the model of universal suffrage for the CE election could be reached, it should be put into practice for at least two CE elections before implementing LegCo election. As to how the principle of “balanced participation” could be realized in the legislature, further discussion needed to be conducted.
Dr Zhou Ba-jun	9.5.2007 15.5.2007 22.5.2007 28.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In respect of model design and roadmap for electing the Legislative Council by universal suffrage, the greatest difficulty at present is how to handle the issue of functional bodies. • The function of functional bodies in Hong Kong’s political system has gone through enormous changes before and after 1997. Their function of representing the interests of the specific sectors or groups is diluting and will dilute with the growing sophistication of political bodies and politicians. Also, in the time when Hong Kong’s political

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
---	-------------------------------	---

ecology is still unable to consciously strike a balance between the conflicts of “two systems” and “one country”, the balancing function of functional bodies in direct election within geographical constituencies, which has been dominated by the pro-democracy camp, is very crucial.

- The development of a democratic political system according to the concept of “one country, two systems” is a ground-breaking attempt without any successful precedents. Apart from the requisites elaborated in the textbooks and writings on politics published in the western countries, certain fundamentals are required to promote the development of a democratic political system under “two systems” within the framework of “one country”.
- Common values developed from the principle of “One Country, Two System” between Hong Kong and the Central Authorities and among the various political factions within Hong Kong are pertinent to universal suffrage in Hong Kong “achieved when the conditions are ripe” and “accomplished naturally with ease” and the long-term stability and prosperity of Hong Kong. That will be the “sustainable” democratic political system.

<u>Members Submitting Views</u>	<u>Date of Submission</u>	<u>Summary of Views</u> ^{Note}
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hong Kong's constitutional development is truly standing at a very crucial crossroads – whether the universal suffrage should be implemented without some of the necessary conditions? Or common values developed from “one country two systems” are needed between Hong Kong community and the Central Authorities and among the various political factions in Hong Kong as soon as possible? Hong Kong people must make a careful choice.
Mr SHIH Wing-ching	16.5.2007	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> If all elector each belong to one of the FC and every person has a chance for voting, elections for FC can also be fair and reasonable. If it is the objective to involve more people to participate, adding in new FCs like housewives, students, retiree can be set up. All existing FCs shall be personalised – everyone can choose one of the following 3 FCs: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Commerce; (ii) Professionals and Management; and (iii) Employees and self-employed. For the number of seats to each sector, it would depend on the social role of the sector in the society.

Note: Please refer to the Central Policy Unit webpage (“Committee on Governance and Political Development- Submissions from Members) –for the original text of the submissions.
(www.cpu.gov.hk/english/csd_gc_submissions_meeting.htm)

Related views raised by Members at previous meetings have been recorded in the summary of views expressed at the meetings. Members are welcome to continue to express their views.