## **Commission on Strategic Development Committee on Governance and Political Development**

## Summary of discussions on the models, roadmap and timetable for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage

# Introduction

The Chief Executive ("the CE") has undertaken to publish a green paper on constitutional development (the "Green Paper") in mid-2007, after the third term HKSAR Government has been formed in July. The HKSAR Government will set out in the Green Paper different views put forth by the Commission on Strategic Development and the community on the options, roadmap and timetable for implementing universal suffrage, and present the relevant views as three types of options to facilitate public discussion. Following the end of the public consultation period, we will submit a report to the Central Authorities, which will reflect any mainstream views formed during the public consultation and other views expressed.

2. Members commenced discussion on the possible models, roadmap and timetable for electing the CE and forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") by universal suffrage last July and September respectively. Members had been narrowing differences on the relevant issues, and had been reducing the scope of discussion as far as possible. This paper aims at summarizing members' views on the possible models, roadmap and timetable for electing the CE by universal suffrage. This will provide a basis for the HKSAR Government to prepare the Green Paper.

3. The summary of views of various organizations and individuals on possible models for electing the CE received by the Administration and LegCo are appended at <u>Annex I</u> and <u>Annex II</u> respectively. A summary of written submissions received by the Commission Secretariat is at <u>Annex III</u>.

# Model for implementing universal suffrage for electing the CE

4. At previous meetings and workshops, members discussed the following three key issues relating to possible models for electing the CE by universal suffrage:

- (a) composition and size of the nominating committee;
- (b) method of nomination; and
- (c) method for selecting the CE by universal suffrage following nomination.

5. Members recognized that, in accordance with Article 45 of the Basic Law, the model for electing the CE by universal suffrage should involve CE candidates being nominated by the nominating committee to be followed by universal suffrage election. Any proposals which did not involve the nomination of candidates by a nominating committee, or which suggested only the election of the CE by universal suffrage (i.e. without forming a nominating committee), would not be consistent with the Basic Law requirement.

## Composition and size of the nominating committee

6. Regarding the composition and size of the nominating committee, most members were inclined to support using the composition of the Election Committee as a basis to consider for forming the nominating committee. As for the size of the nominating committee, members generally considered that the size should not be too large.

7. As regards the composition and size of the nominating committee, members had reduced the scope of discussion to the following three types of options:

- (a) to form the nominating committee by less than 800 members, for example, to form the nominating committee by 60 LegCo Members;
- (b) to form the nominating committee by 800 members, for example, by referring to the existing 800-member Election

Committee as a basis to consider the composition of the nominating committee; and

(c) to form the nominating committee by more than 800 members, for example, by referring to the composition of the existing Election Committee, and increasing the size to 1200-1600 members.

## Nominating committee: less than 800 members

8. The option of forming the nominating committee by less than 800 members involves the proposal to form the nominating committee by 60 LegCo Members. The major reasons were:

- (a) LegCo Members had the broadest electorate base and were the most representative;
- (b) if LegCo played a leading role in the nomination of CE candidates, it would be conducive to improving the relationship between the executive authorities and the legislature; and
- (c) when compared to changing the composition of the existing Election Committee, it would be simpler to form the nominating committee by LegCo Members, so as to enhance the democratic elements of the nominating committee. It would also be more easily understood by the public.

9. However, most members did not support the proposal for the following reasons:

- (a) the Basic Law had already clearly prescribed the functions of LegCo, and had not empowered LegCo Members to nominate CE candidates. The proposal of allowing LegCo to nominate CE candidates was not consistent with the Basic Law;
- (b) according to the Basic Law, the relationship between the executive authorities and the legislature was one of mutual regulation. If CE candidates were nominated by LegCo,

this would undermine the function of the executive authorities and the legislature to operate with due checks and balances, which would not be consistent with the legislative intent of the Basic Law;

- (c) it was prescribed in the Basic Law that the nominating committee should be broadly representative. This was to realize the principle of "balanced participation"<sup>1</sup>. It may not be consistent with the legislative intent of the Basic Law if the nominating committee is composed solely of LegCo Members;
- (d) during the drafting of the Basic Law, the option of nominating CE candidates by LegCo had already been ruled out because this was not consistent with the "executive-led" principle; and
- (e) when voting for LegCo Members, voters had not authorized them to nominate CE candidates on their behalf.

## Nominating committee: 800 members

10. Regarding the option for forming the nominating committee by 800 members, most proposals put forth suggested modelling on the existing Election Committee, with the size of the nominating committee set at 800 members. In fact, most members were inclined to support using the composition of the Election Committee as a basis to consider that of nominating committee. The main reasons included:

(a) Article 45 and Annex I to the Basic Law stipulated respectively that the nominating committee and the Election Committee should be "broadly representative". If the composition of the Election Committee was used as a basis, this should give rise to fewer disputes and should be conducive to forging consensus within the community on the composition of the nominating committee;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> From a certain perspective, the range of sectors covered by the Election Committee is broader than that of the Legislative Council, for example, the religious subsector and the Chinese medicine subsector are represented in the Election Committee, but not in LegCo.

- (b) the composition of the Election Committee complied with such principles as "meeting the interests of the different sectors of society" and "facilitating the development of the capitalist economy". Making reference to the composition of the Election Committee to form the nominating committee could ensure that the committee would comply with these principles; and
- (c) the formation of the Election Committee by four sectors was a useful reference point. Also, using the Election Committee as a basis could help ensure the smooth operation of the nominating committee.

11. The reasons for modelling on the size of the Election Committee (i.e. 800 members) included:

- (a) the 800-member Election Committee was broadly representative, which complied with the principle of balanced participation; and
- (b) too large a membership would cause operational difficulties for the nominating committee.

## Nominating committee: more than 800 members

12. Members also discussed the formation of the nominating committee by modelling on the Election Committee, but with its membership expanded. In this regard, more members suggested expanding the size to 1200 to 1600 members. The major reasons included:

- (a) this could allow wider participation of people from different strata and sectors in the nominating committee, thereby enhancing the representativeness of the committee; and
- (b) this could include sectors which were currently not represented in the Election Committee. This would comply with the principle of "meeting the interests of different sectors of society".

13. However, members held diverse views on the size of the nominating committee, and the relative proportion of different sectors in the committee. In this regard, members discussed mainly the following proposals:

- (a) to form the nominating committee by about 1200 members
   i.e. by adding about 400 elected District Council members
   to 800 members of the Election Committee;
- (b) to enlarge the size of the nominating committee to 1200-1600 members. The number of seats for each of the existing four sectors should be increased evenly;
- (c) using the 2007/08 proposal put forth by the Government in 2005 as a basis, to include all District Council members in the nominating committee and set the size of the nominating committee at 1600. (However, some members considered that appointed District Council members should not be included);
- (d) to allocate the additional seats to sectors which were currently not represented in the Election Committee; and
- (e) to increase suitably the number of members from the business sector, for example, to raise the percentage of members from the industrial, commercial and financial sectors in the Election Committee from 25% to 35% to reflect the contribution of the business sector to Hong Kong. (However, a member considered that the composition of the current Election Committee was already slanted towards the industrial, commercial and professional sectors.)

# Method of nomination

14. In accordance with Article 45 of the Basic Law, there are three stages for electing the CE by universal suffrage:

- Firstly, nomination by a broadly representative nominating committee in accordance with democratic procedures, i.e. a CE candidate will be required to gain the support from representatives of different sectors and strata in the nominating committee;
- Secondly, selection by universal suffrage upon nomination, i.e. a CE candidate will be required to gain the support of the public through "one-person-one- vote"; and
- Thirdly, the CE elected from universal suffrage shall be appointed by the Central People's Government.

Members understood that the nominating committee would play a crucial role in ensuring that the CE elect could meet the interests of different sectors of society.

## Number of subscribers for nominating a candidate

15. Regarding the method of nominating CE candidates by the nominating committee, members previously focused their discussion on the number of subscribers required for nominating a candidate. In overall terms, members were generally inclined to support that, at the early stage of implementing universal suffrage, the nomination threshold should not be too low and there should not be too many candidates. The main reasons included:

- (a) the nomination procedures should ensure that there would not be too many candidates;
- (b) a relatively higher nomination threshold should first be set to help forge consensus among different sectors, so as to implement universal suffrage as early as possible. The system could evolve gradually after universal suffrage had been implemented; and

(c) even if a relatively higher nomination threshold was set, the candidates would still have to face the public because they would need to gain the votes of the public in the process of universal suffrage.

16. Among those members who considered that the nomination threshold should not be too low, more suggested that the nomination threshold should be set at 20% or 25% of the size of the nominating committee.

17. However, some members considered that the nomination threshold should be set at a lower level, for example, for a 1200-member nominating committee, only 50 nominations should be required (i.e. about 4% of the size of the nominating committee), or at least not higher than the existing requirement (i.e. 12.5% of the size of the nominating committee) to enable more candidates to take part in the election. Some members considered that if only a small number of candidates could run for the election as a result of a high nomination threshold, there would not be sufficient competition.

## Nomination in accordance with democratic procedures

18. At the last meeting, members held preliminary discussion on how the method of nomination could comply with the requirement of "nomination in accordance with democratic procedures" as stipulated in Article 45 of the Basic Law. A member pointed out that "nomination in accordance with democratic procedures" would require full and equal participation of the members of the nominating committee in the nomination of candidates. Therefore:

- (a) the nominations obtained by the CE candidates should be from the nominating committee itself, rather than from individual or certain members of the committee; and
- (b) the candidates should have the opportunity to introduce his or her platform to all members of the nominating committee. The nominating committee should then nominate the candidates for universal suffrage through "one-person- one-vote".

## Other nomination requirements

19. Assuming that a nominating committee was to be formed based on the composition of the four sectors of the Election Committee, members discussed whether consideration should be given to requiring candidates to obtain a certain number of nominations in each sector to ensure that the candidates had a certain level of support from different sectors and strata, and that the principle of meeting the interests of different sectors of society would be complied with.

20. As for the number of nominations required in each sector, members had different suggestions, including 5%, 10%, 12.5%, 20% or 25%. However, a few members did not support the above mentioned proposal on the ground that the high threshold amounted to giving members of the nominating committee a power of veto.

21. Some members pointed out that the Central Authorities had the ultimate power to determine the constitutional development of the HKSAR. Hence, in examining the nomination method for the CE, consideration should be given to ways to ensure that the CE elected would be acceptable to both the Central Authorities and the people of Hong Kong.

22. Members discussed the proposal on whether candidates should be required to secure nominations from a certain number of LegCo Members, Hong Kong deputies to the National People's Congress or/and Hong Kong members of the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference. Some members expressed the view that this could ensure that candidates would have sufficient legitimacy. However, some members considered that the nomination mechanism should impose minimal restrictions, and did not agree that any sectors should be given a power of veto.

23. In addition, some members suggested setting an upper limit on the number of subscribers for nominating candidates (e.g. 50%), so that more aspiring individuals would have a chance to get nominated. However, some members held the opposite view. Method of universal suffrage after nomination

24. Members agreed that, after the nomination of candidates, the CE should be elected by universal suffrage on the basis of "one-person-one-vote".

25. Members explored on a preliminary basis the following related issues, but had not discussed them in depth:

(a) <u>Whether one or more rounds of election should be held after</u> <u>nomination</u>

In this regard, members expressed different views, including:

- (i) holding more than one round of election until a candidate was returned by receiving more than half of the valid votes cast. This could enhance the legitimacy of the CE;
- (ii) holding two rounds of elections, in which only two candidates could enter the second round of universal suffrage. In the final round, the candidate who received more than half of the valid votes cast would be elected. This proposal could ensure that the CE elect would obtain a clear majority of the votes, so as to enhance the legitimacy of the CE; and
- (iii) holding only one round of universal suffrage and adopt a simple majority voting system. The candidate who received the highest number of valid votes cast would be elected. This could avoid having to invest an enormous amount of social resources to arrange for another round of voting by all registered voters.
- (b) <u>Whether the election proceedings should continue if there</u> was only one candidate

In this regard, members expressed different views:

- (i) some members considered that as it was prescribed in the Basic Law that the nomination of the CE by the nominating committee should be followed by universal suffrage, election by universal suffrage should still be held even when there was only one candidate. This would allow the public to express their wish. Some members supported this proposal and considered that the candidate should be required to receive more than half of the valid votes cast or a specified percentage of votes to get elected. This could ensure that the CE elect would have legitimacy.
- (ii) However, some members considered that if the election proceedings continued when there was only one candidate, this might distort the overall inclination of voters, because those who were against the candidate would have a stronger intention to vote. This would in turn affect the CE election process.

#### Roadmap and timetable for implementing universal suffrage for the CE

26. Members discussed whether universal suffrage for the CE should precede that for LegCo. Members generally considered that there were still significant differences within the Commission and among different sectors of the community on models for forming LegCo by universal suffrage, particularly on how the functional constituencies (FCs) should evolve. It was, therefore, anticipated that it would not be easy for the community to reach consensus on the model for forming LegCo by universal suffrage in the short term. Relatively speaking, the major issues that needed to be addressed in relation to the model for electing the CE by universal suffrage were the composition of the nominating committee and the nomination mechanism. In this regard, members had been forming mainstream views on some of the related issues gradually, and hence, there should be a higher chance that the community could first reach consensus on the model for electing the CE by universal suffrage. Therefore, quite a number of members agreed that consideration should be given to the direction of "resolving the simple issues" before the difficult ones" in taking forward constitutional development, and that universal suffrage for the CE should be implemented first.

27. If the community generally supports the direction of "universal suffrage for the CE should precede that for LegCo", we need to consider whether the existing electoral model (i.e. an 800-member Election Committee):

- (a) should be transformed to universal suffrage in one go by forming the nominating committee directly; or
- (b) should be transformed to universal suffrage by first going through a transitional phase.

28. In this regard, members held diverse views: some members proposed attaining universal suffrage in one go by forming the nominating committee directly in 2012. At the same time, some members suggested first going through a transitional phase and attaining universal suffrage in 2017 or thereafter.

# Conclusions

29. To conclude, members' previous discussions on the models, roadmap and timetable for electing the CE by universal suffrage are summarized below:

## Composition and size of nominating committee

- (a) members were inclined to support using the composition of the Election Committee as a basis to consider that of the nominating committee;
- (b) on the size of the nominating committee, members were inclined to support that the number of members should not be too large. More members suggested modelling on the size of the existing 800-member Election Committee, or expanding it to 1200 or 1600; and
- (c) regarding the relative proportion of different sectors in the committee, members discussed different proposals, but had not formed any mainstream views.

## Nomination method

- (d) in overall terms, members were generally inclined to support that, at the early stage of implementing universal suffrage, the nomination threshold should not be too low and there should not be too many candidates. More members suggested setting the nomination threshold at the range of 12.5% to 25%. However, some members considered that the nomination threshold should be set at a lower level, at least not higher than the existing requirement (i.e. 12.5% of the size of the nominating committee);
- (e) members explored on a preliminary basis the requirement of "nomination in accordance with democratic procedures" as prescribed in Article 45 of the Basic Law, but had not discussed the issue in-depth; and
- (f) members discussed whether other nomination requirements should be set, including whether candidates should be required to obtain a certain number of nominations in each sector, and whether an upper limit on the number of subscribers should be set, but had not formed any mainstream views on the relevant issues.

## Method of Universal Suffrage after Nomination

- (g) members agreed that, after the nomination of candidates, the CE should be elected by universal suffrage on the basis of "one-person-one-vote";
- (h) members explored preliminarily whether the CE should be elected through one round of election without the requirement that a candidate should receive more than half of the valid votes to be elected, or whether there should be a requirement that a candidate should receive more than half of the valid votes to get elected, and thus more than one round of election would be held if necessary. However, members had not discussed the issues in-depth; and

(i) members explored preliminarily whether the election proceedings should continue if there was only one candidate. However, members had not discussed the issues in-depth.

# Roadmap and timetable for implementing universal suffrage for the CE

- (j) quite a number of members agreed that consideration should be given to the direction of "resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones" in taking forward constitutional development, and that universal suffrage for the CE should precede that for LegCo; and
- (k) regarding the timetable for electing the CE by universal suffrage, members had not formed any mainstream views on whether the nominating committee should be formed directly to achieve the ultimate aim of universal suffrage in one go, or whether there should be a transitional phase before implementing universal suffrage. Some members proposed forming the nominating committee directly in one go in 2012, while some suggested going through a transitional phase and attaining universal suffrage in 2017 or thereafter.

Constitutional Affairs Bureau June 2007

## Annex I

# **Commission on Strategic Development Committee on Governance and Political Development**

# Public views on possible models for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage

## Written submissions received by the Government

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
Mr Eric K C LI	4.1.2004	• First Phase: turn the 800-member Election Committee into a nominating committee and elect no more than 3 candidates for universal suffrage.
		• Second and Final Phase: full universal suffrage.
SynergyNet	13.2.2004	• Any 500 registered voters can together make a preliminary nomination of a candidate for the CE post. Each registered voter can make only one such nomination.
		• Preliminary nominees will be scrutinized by the Nomination Committee. Only those preliminary nominees who obtain the endorsement of a minimum of 100 members of the Nomination Committee will be put forward for election by universal suffrage. Each Committee member can nominate only one preliminary nominee. In practice, this means a maximum of 8 preliminary candidates to be

15

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
		'screened in' by an 800-member Nomination Committee for popular election.
		<ul> <li>The total membership of the Nomination Committee can be 800 or an enlarged number such as 1 000 – 1 200. Members of the Nomination Committee from different sectors should be elected on the basis of one-person-one-vote within the sectors to which they belong.</li> </ul>
Hong Kong Democratic Foundation and Power for Democracy	13.2.2004	• Option 1: Formal candidacy for the CE requires nomination by a certain number of Election Committee members. A low threshold such as 50 can facilitate candidates from various political backgrounds to stand for election. Election of the CE by universal suffrage after nomination by the Election Committee.
		• Option 2: A CE candidate may qualify for formal candidacy through the collection of a certain number of supporting signatures from registered voters (say, 50 000 – 100 000), followed by election by universal suffrage.
Article 45 Concern Group	23.2.2004	• Either to convert the present Election Committee to a nomination committee whose only function is to nominate any candidate with the endorsement of say, 5% of its members, or to give power to the Legislative Council (LegCo) to

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		nominate any candidate with the endorsement of say, 5 members. The general electorate will vote on all candidates thus nominated on a one-person- one-vote basis.
Democratic Party	25.5.2004	The nominating committee should be formed by Members of the LegCo. A CE candidate may be nominated by 5 LegCo Members (each LegCo Member may nominate only one candidate). Members of the public will vote on all candidates thus nominated on a one-person-one-vote basis.
Hong Kong University Graduates Association Political Reform Concern Group	9.2004	• To transform the 800-member Election Committee into a 1200- member nominating committee. The method for electing members should be similar to that of the existing Election Committee.
		• A CE candidate should be jointly nominated by not less than 150, but not more than 200 members of the nominating committee (with not less than 25 members from each sector). Each member may only nominate one candidate.
		• Election of the CE by universal suffrage will be held after nomination. As regards the election and vote counting methods, consideration should be given to requiring a candidate to secure more than half of the valid votes in order to be elected.

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
The Law Society of Hong Kong	27.9.2004	The nominating committee can take the form of either a separate Committee, or transformed from the Election Committee or the LegCo.
Hon Mrs Rita FAN	27.9.2004	• CE candidates could be elected by universal suffrage upon nomination by a nominating committee.
		• The nominating committee should comprise 1600 members from different sectors (same as those of the Election Committee) who are returned by election. Formal candidacy for the CE requires nomination by not less than 400 Committee members.
Hon Albert CHAN	15.10.2004	• A CE candidate may qualify for formal candidacy if he is able to secure nominations by not less than 5 000 registered voters, and the support of not less than 5% of the Election Committee.
		• After nomination, candidates will be elected by all electors in Hong Kong by universal suffrage. The candidate receiving the highest number of votes will become the CE. The Election Committee should validate the election result procedurally, and the candidate elected will become the CE upon validation.
Joint Committee for the Promotion of the Basic Law of Hong Kong	21.10.2004	• To turn the Election Committee into the nominating committee. The method for electing members of the

Organizations/individuals	Date of
making the submissions	Submission

Summary of Views

nominating committee should be the same as that for electing members of the Election Committee. The number of members should be increased to 1 600. In each sector, there should be 25 members returned by universal suffrage through geographical constituencies.

- Each member of the nominating committee may nominate only one candidate, and each candidate must be nominated by 200 members.
- If only one candidate is elected by the nominating committee, that candidate will be elected *ipso facto*. If more than one candidate are elected by the nominating committee, election by universal suffrage shall be held.
- The Election Committee which currently elects the CE consists of four sectors, each comprising 200 delegates.
  - These delegates are themselves elected or chosen by either the individual members or by the elected committee of the relevant organization.
  - The first, second and third sectors of the Committee elect or select their representatives some by the votes of individual members, and some chosen by the committee of the organization. In order to make sure the

Business and Professionals Federation of Hong Kong

25.7.2006

representatives do indeed represent the general membership of the constituent organization there should be an effort to systemize the method of selection and to endeavour to involve the general membership on these organizations in the election of their representatives.

- The fourth sector comprises the individual members of representative bodies having a largely political role. To enhance the authority of this sector, a number of new seats were proposed to be elected by an electoral college of all the District Councillors. Changes in the District Councils are currently being examined and the role of the appointed members will no doubt be discussed during the course of this review. Thus the inclusion or not of District Councillors should wait until this review is completed.
- Nomination of CE candidates should be based on a closed-ballot.
- Each candidate should secure the support and nomination of at least 100 members out of a nominating committee of 800.
- Candidates might be required to secure at least 20 nominations from each of the four sectors and each candidate in addition should have among his nominators the support of at least 15 of the 60 Members of

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		LegCo (i.e. one-fourth of the 60 LegCo Members). This requirement would limit the number of candidates to four to enter the final election process.
		• To elect the CE through a one man one vote process; the one-round first-past-the-post voting method is the preferred option.
Mr David YUEN	29.7.2006	• An electoral college system (with 1 000 electoral college votes) should be adopted, of which 30% of the votes (i.e. 300 electoral college votes) should be determined by the Central Government while the other 70% should be decided by universal suffrage.
		• Election on the basis of one-person-one-vote should be first held. The 700 electoral college votes should be apportioned on the basis of the votes received. In the following 1-2 weeks, the Central Government would cast its sacred vote (i.e. the 300 electoral college votes). The election result would then be determined by the number of the electoral college votes received by the candidates.

• As for the nomination method, candidates would be required to secure nominations from 200 registered voters.

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
Chu Hai College Students' Union	13.8.2006	• Composition of the nominating committee:
		The first sector: about 200 members from the business sector.
		The second sector: about 200 members from the professional sector.
		The third sector: about 400 members from education, labour, religious, social services and other sectors.
		The fourth sector: about 700 members comprising LegCo Members, District Councils (DC) members, Executive Council Members, Hong Kong deputies to the National People's Congress (NPC), Hong Kong members of the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference (CPPCC).
		• Based on the above, a nominating committee with 1500–1600 members will be formed.
		• For candidates nominated by political parties, they will be required to secure nomination from only 5% of the nominating committee members. As for independent candidates, they will be required to secure nominations from 10% of the nominating committee members. Those who have secured sufficient number of nominations will become CE

candidates for election by universal

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		suffrage.
City University of Hong Kong Students' Union	14.8.2006	<ul> <li>As a transitional arrangement before implementing universal suffrage, the composition of the nominating committee should make reference to the proposed package put forth last year. The number of members should increase from 800 to 1600. Members of the Election Committee in the first sector (industrial, commercial and financial sectors), second sector (the professionals) and third sector (labour, social services, religious and other sectors) should increase from 200 to 300. The fourth sector (LegCo members, DC members, representatives of Heung Yee Kuk, Hong Kong deputies to the NPC, representatives of Hong Kong members of the CPPCC) should increase from 200 to 700, including all DC members.</li> <li>The nomination threshold for electing the CE by universal suffrage for the first time could be increased (e.g. from 1/8 of all committee members to the sector).</li> </ul>
		1/4), but the Government should undertake to conduct regular reviews in future with a view to lowering the threshold gradually.
		<ul><li>In addition to increasing the</li></ul>

• In addition to increasing the nomination threshold, a mechanism to allow voters to recommend candidates should be introduced. Any person who has the support of 5% of

eligible voters in Hong Kong should be deemed to be recommended by voters as a candidate. As the candidate endorsed by voters should have already obtained a certain level of support from the electorate, the nomination threshold for him should be lowered. He will only need to obtain endorsement from 1/8 of the nominating committee members to stand for election.

- When the model for implementing universal suffrage has been fully developed, consideration should be given to allowing the public to take lead in the nomination process. For example, CE candidates would only be eligible for consideration by the nominating committee if they have obtained nominations from a certain number of registered voters. A candidate can stand for election at the final stage only after he has secured a certain level of support from the nominating committee.
- To increase the number of committee members from 800 to 1200.
  - Regarding the method for forming the committee responsible for nominating CE candidates, the nomination method and the number of subscribers required for nominating a CE candidate, further discussion within the community will be needed in order to reach consensus.

Heung Yee Kuk (Submission for the 2006/07 Policy Address)

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
Hong Kong Democratic Foundation	16.8.2006	<ul> <li>Option 1:</li> <li>Direct election of the CE through universal suffrage as soon as possible, namely 2012.</li> </ul>
		<ul> <li><u>Option 2</u>:</li> <li>Increasing the membership of the Election Committee from 800 to, say, 1600 or 2400, turning it into a nominating committee.</li> </ul>
		• After the nominating committee endorses a number of candidates, who will have to compete among themselves by gaining a certain percentage of votes from the nominating committee, then all the eligible voters in the HKSAR will be entitled to vote for their CE candidates.
		<ul> <li><u>Option 3</u>:</li> <li>Widening the membership of the Election Committee. This option is arguably so conservative that it will perhaps be bound to be rejected in the legislative assembly.</li> </ul>
Executive Committee of	16 8 2006	As a transitional arrangement for and

Executive Committee of 16.8.2006 the Hong Kong University Students' Union

- As a transitional arrangement for one term, the existing Election Committee should be responsible for nominating the CE candidates.
- The Election Committee should include all LegCo Members and elected DC members.

- As for other subsectors, corporate voting should be abolished and replaced by individual voting. The nominating committee should be abolished in 2012 in order to achieve the aim of electing the CE by universal suffrage.
- As regards the nomination threshold, candidates should be required to secure nominations from 10% of the nominating committee members when the committee is still in place. In future CE elections, candidates who have received nominations from 500 members of the public would be eligible to stand for election.
- If there is only one candidate or there are two, a candidate must obtain more than half of the support votes to get elected, or a fresh round of election would be conducted. If there are three or more candidates and none of them receives more than half of the votes in then first round. the two the candidates with the highest number of votes in the first round will enter into the second round. A fresh round of election would be held if none of the candidates receives more than half of the votes cast.
- 18.8.2006 To transform the current 800-member Election Committee into an 800-member nominating committee.

Mr Hilton CHEONG-LEEN

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong (DAB's expectations of the 2006/2007 Policy Address)	18.8.2006	• Given the present political environment and the level of socio-economic development of Hong Kong, we should promote the approaches of "formulating a roadmap before a timetable" and "resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones".
		• By "formulating a roadmap before a timetable", we should first formulate the ultimate models for implementing universal suffrage for the two elections, to be followed by formulating a phased plan leading to universal suffrage. Finally, a timetable can be formulated based on the actual situation.
		• By "resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones", universal suffrage for the CE can first be implemented. Thereafter, according to the actual situation, we can reform the method for forming the LegCo and its procedures of voting in two or three stages, and finally implement universal suffrage for the LegCo.
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing (Proposals for the Policy Address)	21.8.2006	• Before the Basic Law can be amended, the "broadly representative nominating committee" under Article 45 should be formed by election on

• The threshold for nominating candidates should not be too high, and the nomination mechanism

the basis of one-person-one-vote.

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
		should not be used to prevent those holding dissenting views from participating in the election. If restrictions are imposed to prevent those candidates not acceptable to the Central Authorities from standing for election, such an election by universal suffrage would be hypocritical and deceptive.
The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce	23.8.2006	• The composition of the nominating committee may model on that of the existing Election Committee. The number of members can remain at 800.
		• Each candidate should be required to receive nominations from at least 200 nominating committee members. With each member nominating only one candidate, there will not be more than four CE candidates.
		• Of the nominations received by a candidate, at least 50 should come from the industrial, commercial and financial sectors.
		• Following nomination, the CE will be returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote by all eligible voters.
Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations	23.8.2006	• It will be more appropriate to maintain the membership of the Election Committee at 800. The 38 subsectors under the four sectors in the existing Election Committee have

making the submissions	<u>Submission</u>	
		already covered different sectors of society.
		• Those who intend to stand for the CE election should be required to receive nominations from and support of 1/4 of the nominating committee members. Two to three candidates will then be selected to stand for election. The CE will be returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
Mr Robin CHAN Yau-hing Chairman, Hong Kong Federation of Overseas Chinese Associations	29.8.2006	• The nominating committee should be formed on the basis of the existing Election Committee, with all Hong Kong members of the CPPCC included.
		• Aspiring individuals should be required to receive nominations from 1/4 of the nominating committee members to become candidates. This is to ensure that candidates are qualified and endorsed by different parties.
		• Finally, the CE will be returned by universal suffrage.
Hong Kong Social Workers Association (Views on the 2006 Policy Address)	29.8.2006	• Before universal suffrage for CE is implemented, the electorate base of the Election Committee should be expanded.

Date of

Summary of Views

Organizations/individuals

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
Kowloon City District Resident Association	30.8.2006	• The functions of the existing Election Committee should be changed by retaining the function of nominating CE candidates while removing that of electing the CE.
		• The formation of the Election Committee based on different professions/sectors, the election method and the size of membership at 800 should remain unchanged.
		• Candidates should secure a prescribed number of nominations from the nominating committee members before they can enter the stage which their eligibility will be verified by the Electoral Affairs Commission. The nomination threshold should be lower than the present one (i.e. 100 nominations). For example, the minimum requirement may be set at 50 nominations.
		• Each member may nominate only one candidate.

- It is appropriate to limit the number of candidates to two. If more than two contenders have received the required number of nominations, the two who secured the highest number of nominations will become CE candidates.
- The CE will be returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
		by all eligible voters.
Civic Party (Civic Party's Policy Expectations of the SAR Government)	31.8.2006	• Hong Kong is long ready for implementing universal suffrage for the two elections. Democratic election to be held on the basis of equal and universal suffrage is a prerequisite for being an "international city".
Democratic Party (Democratic Party's submission for the 2006/07 Policy Address "The Building of a Truly Accountable Government")	4.9.2006	• The nominating committee should be formed by LegCo Members. The CE should be returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote and appointed by the Central People's Government.
		• A CE candidate may be nominated by five LegCo Members. Each LegCo Member may nominate only one candidate.
		• A candidate with political party background, if elected as CE by universal suffrage, should not be required to withdraw from his party.
SynergyNet (Views submitted at the consultation meeting of the 2006/07 Policy Address)	5.9.2006	• In order to improve governance, the Government should carry out political reforms with a view to attaining universal suffrage and enhancing its legitimacy.
Kowloon Federation of Associations (Opinion survey on expectations of the 2006-07 Policy	5.9.2006	• Under the principle of gradual and orderly progress in taking forward Hong Kong's constitutional development, this Association supports taking the approach of

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
Address)		"resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones". The issue of electing the CE by universal suffrage should be handled first. The elections of the CE and LegCo by universal suffrage should not be bundled together, otherwise the pace of constitutional development in Hong Kong will be dampened.
The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong	13.9.2006	• Universal suffrage for electing the CE should be implemented before that for forming the LegCo.
		<ul> <li>Reference should be made to the composition of the existing Election Committee. The number of members should remain at 800. The Committee should be formed by four sectors:         <ul> <li>(a) 200 members from the industrial, commercial and financial sectors;</li> <li>(b) 200 members from various professions;</li> <li>(c) 200 members from</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

the labour, social services, religious sectors; (d) 200 members from LegCo

Kong deputies to the NPC, and

of

The election method should be

modelled on that for the existing Election Committee to ensure smooth transition from the old to the new

district-based organizations,

members of the CPPCC.

representatives

Hong

of

Hong

Kong

Members,

representatives

electoral system.

32

٠

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		• Nominating committee members should select, by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote, not more than three CE candidates from those who have obtained nominations from 100 or more members.
		• The CE should be returned by universal suffrage on the basis of one-person-one-vote. Among the CE candidates (no more than three), the one who obtains the highest number of valid votes cast will be returned as the CE elect, who will then be officially appointed by the Central People's Government as the CE.
Professor WONG Ka-ying	14.9.2006	• To maintain the current Election Committee system and the nomination threshold with a view to pursuing the implementation of universal suffrage in 2012. This can respond to the demand of the pro-democracy camp for early attainment of universal suffrage. The proposal should serve as a basis for compromise between the Central Authorities and the pro-democracy camp on the issue of electing the CE by universal suffrage.
Mr Ivan CHOY Chi-keung	2.10.2006	• The delineation of the sectors of the existing Election Committee can generally be adopted. That is, if the nominating committee comprises 800 members, 200 can be from the industrial, commercial and financial sectors, 200 from the professions, 200

Organizations/individuals Date of <u>making the submissions</u> <u>Submission</u>

Summary of Views

from the political sector and 200 from various sectors of the community.

- Members of different sectors of the nominating committee should be returned by democratic elections as far as possible, so as to enhance the representativeness and credibility of the nominating committee.
- In essence, if a certain nomination threshold is set to help forge consensus of different parties on implementing universal suffrage for the CE in 2012, a timetable should be formulated to abolish such a threshold in two or three terms.
- For electing the CE by universal suffrage for the first time, a relatively higher number of subscribers could be required (e.g. 100). Thereafter, the number of subscribers required should be reduced gradually.
- Among the 100 subscribers, the number of subscribers from each of the four sectors should at least be 10.
- Among the 100 subscribers, at least 15 should come from LegCo Members.
- A two-round voting system should be adopted. Any candidate who has received more than half of the votes cast in the first round will be elected.

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
		If none of the candidates is able to obtain more than half of the votes, the two candidates receiving the highest number of votes will enter into the second and final round. The candidate who receives a majority of votes in the second round will be elected.
Mr CHANG Chak-yan	23.11.2006	• In principle, it is impossible to break away from the realm of sovereignty. Also, according to international practice, the power to make appointment reflects the sovereignty of a country. After assessing political risks, the proposal to prescreen CE candidates before universal suffrage is preferable.
		• In order to remove doubts about verification of the eligibility of candidates and reduce political controversies, the best course of action is to reach consensus first before enacting a law on verification of the eligibility of CE candidates.
Kowloon Federation of Associations	4.12.2006 10.5.2007	• Should first deal with the election of the CE by universal suffrage, which is less controversial and adopt the pragmatic approach of "resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones". Support focusing on handling the election of the CE by universal suffrage first.
		• The roadmap of universal suffrage should be drawn up first with a view

35

to

reaching

consensus

among

different sectors of society. Practical and sound proposals on the timetable issue could then follow the direction of the planned roadmap.

- The Election Committee should double its membership to 1600 and turn into a nominating committee.
- The total nominations secured by a CE candidate from the 1 600-member nominating committee should not be less than 100 (i.e. 1/16). Nominations so secured should include at least 10 nominations from each of the four sectors within the nominating committee. In addition, it should include nominations from at least five LegCo Members and five HK Deputies to the NPC.
- A CE candidate should be required to secure more than 50% of the valid votes cast to get elected. If none of the candidates obtains more than 50% of the valid votes cast, a second round should be held to elect the CE among the two candidates who have received the highest votes in the first round.
- Increasing the size of the nominating committee will not, in itself, help to make the nominating committee more truly representative of the Hong Kong community.
  - If the option of converting the present Election Committee into the

Mrs Anson Chan and her Core Group

5.3.2007

nominating committee is be to selected, then it will be necessary to take steps to broaden the franchise of the sub-sectors, as well as to consider the addition of further sub-sectors to ensure that, as far as possible, the members of the nominating committee can legitimately claim to wishes represent the of the community as a whole.

- Candidates are required to receive nominations from 10% of nominating committee members. If the size of the nominating committee is kept at 800 members, this would mean that prospective candidates require a minimum of 80 nominations.
- Implementation of universal suffrage for the election of the CE raises far fewer issues to be resolved than in the case of implementation of universal suffrage for elections to LegCo. Given the wide measure of consensus which already exists within the community, in relation to the principle of converting the current Election Committee into the future nominating committee, there seems to no fundamental reason be why universal suffrage for the CE election should not be introduced at the first permissible date, namely in 2012.

22 LegCo Members

27.3.2007

• Before the Basic Law could be amended to abolish the nominating committee, the nominating committee

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
		should be transformed, in 2012, from the existing 800-member Election Committee. By also including about 400 elected District Council members, the nominating committee would become 1200-member strong.
		• CE candidates could be nominated by 50 members from any sector.
		• CE should be returned by universal suffrage though "one-person-one-vote".
Dr Dixon Sing Ming	3.4.2007	<ul> <li>Qualification for Formal Candidacy</li> <li>Any adult, who is a resident of Hong Kong and has resided in Hong Kong for not less than ten years, is in principle eligible to stand for CE election if he gets nominated.</li> </ul>
		• CE candidates who are members of political parties should be allowed to run in the election.
		<ul> <li>Nomination Method</li> <li>To convert the present Election Committee into a nominating committee for nominating CE candidates to run in the election by universal suffrage. The number of</li> </ul>

• Corporate voting should be abolished by 2012, and the electorate base

members should be increased to 3200 in 2012, in order to accommodate all DC members and a larger number of Hong Kong members of the CPPCC. Organizations/individuals Date of <u>making the submissions</u> <u>Submission</u> Summary of Views

should be expanded considerably.

- In 2012, every candidate should receive nominations from at least 12.5% of the nominating committee members.
- In 2012, every candidate who gets nominated should receive nominations from at least 5% of members from each of the four sectors mentioned in Annex I to the Basic Law.
- In the 2012 election, every candidate who gets nominated is required to secure nominations from at least 25% of the LegCo Members.
- Each member of the nominating committee may nominate only one candidate.

Electoral Method

- In 2012, all registered voters may elect the CE by universal suffrage.
- One round of voting on the basis of the first-past-the-post should be adopted in the CE election.
- Propose to increase the number of nominating committee members from 800 to 3200. The four sectors of the existing Election Committee should be replaced by two main divisions which modelled on LegCo elections, namely the geographical constituencies and functional constituencies, each taking

Hong Kong Citizen (without signature)

8.4.2007

up 1600 seats.

- (a) Geographical constituencies include:
  - not more than 800 members. (i) LegCo comprising all Members, DC members, Hong Kong deputies to the NPC, Hong Kong members of the CPPCC and recipients of HKSAR honours and awards. If more than 800 people are eligible, LegCo Members, DC members. Hong Kong deputies to the NPC and Hong Kong members of the CPPCC will be designated as ex-officio members, while the rest will be offered a seat through screening according to the classes of their honours and awards.
  - (ii) Besides, 800 members plus any unfilled quotas of item(i) will returned be by geographical elections (in the form of DC election) held in various districts of the territory using the representation proportional method.
- (b) Functional constituencies may adopt the groupings of functional constituencies of the existing LegCo, retaining the original industrial and commercial,

Organizations/individuals	Date of
making the submissions	Submission

financial sectors (increased to 500 members), professionals (increased to 500 members) and labour and social services sectors (increased to 400 members), as well as the religious sector (200 members) etc. In addition, new functional constituencies may be added or the ratio of appointed members may be raised, in order to increase the membership to 1600. For the selection of new members, the existing electoral method of functional constituencies LegCo of the should be adopted.

- It is proposed that each candidate should secure nominations of not less than 17.5% (560 nominations) of the total members in order to be qualified to run in the CE election.
- Elect a CE on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
- If a consensus cannot be reached concerning the election of CE bv universal suffrage in 2012. a 800-member nominating committee should be formed in 2012. Electors of the nominating committee will elect a CE basis of on the one-person-one-vote.
  - The 800-member nominating committee to be formed in 2017 will nominate a list of candidates. A CE

Hong Kong Civic Association 10.4.2007 3.5.2007 10.5.2007

Organizations/individuals	Date of
making the submissions	Submission

Summary of Views

will then be elected by one-person-one-vote.

- To convert the Election Committee into a nominating committee, with membership maintained at 800. In order to enhance its representativeness, the nominating committee should be composed of members returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
- Nomination threshold should be maintained at 100 (ie 1/8 of the membership).
- After verifying the eligibility of CE candidates, the CE elect will be returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote by all voters of Hong Kong. The power of appointment continues to be vested in the Central Government.
- If the Central Government does not announce the appointment of CE within seven days after the election, the re-election process will be activated automatically. Nomination and election will be conducted within six months.

Mr WONG Hok-kut 10.4.2007 President of Asia-Pacific Institute of International Relations

Basic Law Institute

11.4.2007

- The required number of nominations to be secured by a CE candidate should be reduced by half, ie. not less than 50 members of the Election Committee may jointly nominate a CE candidate.
- 800-member Election Committee is well qualified to transform into a nominating committee in 2017. The operation of the nominating committee should follow that of 2012, that is, not 50 members of less than the nominating committee may jointly nominate a CE contender. Following initial nomination. formal two candidates (who have obtained the highest numbers of votes) will be returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote by the full board of the nominating committee in with accordance democratic procedures. All qualified residents of Hong Kong may cast their votes on these two candidates on the basis of one-person-one-vote to return the CE of the HKSAR for appointment by the **CPG**

New Century Forum

12.4.2007

- The main principles of the CE election in 2012:
  - 1. a modest nomination mechanism which allows three to four candidates to run in the election.
  - 2. composition of the nominating committee and the nomination

Organizations/individuals	Date of
making the submissions	<b>Submission</b>

Summary of Views

mechanism should be in line with the principle of balanced participation.

- 3. all members of nominating committee should be Hong Kong permanent residents of Chinese nationality.
- Specific proposals:
  - 1. to transfer the existing functions of the Election Committee to the nominating committee. Electoral method, composition and number of sectors of the nominating committee should be the same as that of the existing Election Committee.
  - 2. candidates must secure nominations from not less than 160 members. They have to obtain not less than 20% (ie 40) and not more than 25% (ie 50) nominations from each of the four sectors (ie the industrial, commercial and financial sectors, the professions, labour, social service, religious and other sectors and political sectors).
  - 3. Upon confirmation, the CE will be returned by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote. The one who secures more than half of the valid votes will become the CE.
  - 4. If there is only one candidate, a vote of confidence will be conducted. If

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
		he cannot secure more than half of the valid votes, it is necessary to re-activate the nomination procedure until a candidate is able to get more than half of the valid votes.
Hong Kong Policy Research Institute Limited	18.4.2007 9.5.2007	• The method for selecting CE in 2012 should comply with the requirements laid down in Article 45 of the Basic Law, which stipulates that CE should be elected by universal suffrage upon nomination by a broadly representative nominating committee.
		• The nominating committee may follow the delineation of sectors under the existing Election Committee. Members of these sectors should be returned by democratic elections within their own sectors as far as possible, so as to enhance the representativeness and credibility of the nominating committee.
		• The nomination threshold should be set at 10% of the nominating committee members.
Mr TSUI Dai-lam (transliteration)	19.4.2007	• The CE of the SAR should be nominated by a nominating committee and elected by all voters of Hong Kong on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
		• A candidate must secure the approval of more than 50% of the nominating committee members. This is neither a preliminary selection nor

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		pre-screening. It should be referred as a decision made by voting after discussion or consultation.
		• There should not be too many candidates. Two to three will suffice.
Mr WONG Siu-yee	26.4.2007	• Two issues have to be considered for attaining universal suffrage: one is by adopting the approach of "resolving the simple issues before the difficult ones" (the approach), and the other is by establishing a constitution protection mechanism. The approach consists of two parts: the first one is to "formulate a roadmap before a timetable", the second one is to achieve "universal suffrage for the CE preceding that for LegCo".
		• Rather than indulge in the endless debate on the timetable of attaining universal suffrage, parties concerned should take the approach of "formulating a roadmap before a timetable", shelving the dispute on timetable and commencing work on practical issues. Discussions should be conducted in a pragmatic manner, with a view to reaching consensus on the formulation of roadmap for universal suffrage before determining a

• The function of the nominating committee is to acquire the consent and support from both the Central

for

attaining

universal

timetable

suffrage.

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		Government and the people of Hong Kong on the CE candidates.
		• The nominating committee will exist in name only if it does not have a screening mechanism. Without initial screening, the Central Government may subsequently exercise a veto over the CE elect whom it does not accept, leading to the conduct of a new round of election. This will bring about an enormous political upheaval, which may even cause a constitutional crisis. It is, therefore, necessary to set up a constitution protection mechanism in relation to CE election by universal suffrage.
Mr CHIM Ming (transliteration)	3.5.2007	• To convert the Election Committee into a nominating committee in 2012. The four sectors will each nominate one candidate. All the 800 members will then select two candidates out of the four by a simple majority voting method, who will then run in the CE election by universal suffrage.
		• To convert the Election Committee into a nominating committee in 2012. The four sectors will each nominate one candidate to run in the election of CE by universal suffrage. The CE will ultimately be returned by two rounds of voting.
The Democratic Party	3.5.2007	• In 2012, the nominating committee should be formed by 1200 members, comprising 800 Election Committee

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		members and about 400 elected DC members. 50 members from any sector may nominate one CE candidate. The CE will then be elected on the basis of one-person-one-vote, which fully reflects the principle of democracy and the implementation of universal suffrage.
Mr LAI Chi-lap	4.5.2007	• There is only one model for implementing universal suffrage, i.e. referendum.
		• CE candidates are required to secure nominations from ten thousand members of the public.
		• Suggest abolishing appointed members to District Councils. The right to vote for the CE of the appointed members may be questioned.
Mr WONG Kam-din	8.5.2007	• The community should reach a consensus on the model for implementing "universal suffrage" before determining on the roadmap and timetable.
		• Models for selecting CE and forming LegCo by universal suffrage may not be the same as they represent different political entities.
		• 2012 is not the right time to select CE by universal suffrage, i.e. direct election on the basis of one-person-one-vote.

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		• The number of nominations to be secured by a candidate should be high rather than low and the eligibility criteria for a candidate should be stringent rather than loose.
		• The nomination threshold in regard to elections by universal suffrage should be higher than that of the existing threshold of 1/8 of the nominating committee.
Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations	9.5.2007	• Any so-called "proposal" which jumble models for implementing universal suffrage with Basic Law

considered.

• The 38 subsectors under the four the existing in Election sectors Committee responsible for selecting the CE have already covered different sectors of society. It meets the requirements of "broadly representative" and in particular, the principle of balanced participation. A Election Committee returned on such basis should be acceptable to different conducive sectors and to the maintenance of social stability and harmony.

amendments should therefore not be

- As new sectors are coming up, corresponding adjustments in the light of the actual situation should be made.
- There is no need to set a timetable for attaining "dual universal suffrage".

Organizations/individuals making the submissions	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
38 <sup>th</sup> Student Union of Chu Hai College of Higher Education	10.5.2007	• As to the CE election, which is claimed by the Government to be "highly representative", most of the students in Hong Kong do not have any opportunity to participate, or a right to vote.
		• Support the attainment of universal suffrage in 2012 and propose to abolish the nominating committee. Those who secure nominations from thirty thousand eligible electors will become CE candidates. Residents of Hong Kong will cast their votes to return a CE by universal suffrage.
Basic Law Institute	21.5.2007	• Article 45 clearly provides that the entity responsible for nomination is the "nominating committee", and not a certain number of members or individual member of the nominating committee. Nomination should therefore, only be made by "nominating committee" itself.
		• Article 45 of the Basic Law does not prescribe any threshold for "candidacy". Apart from the eligibility for formal CE candidacy expressly provided in Article 44, other qualifications for "candidacy" should

• Although Article 45 of the Basic Law does not prescribe the "threshold", at least there should be one recommender and one seconder on the operational level. That being the case, there may

be made by local legislation.

be a maximum of 400 contenders in theory.

- Article 45 clearly stipulates that the nominating committee should be "broadly representative". It should be noted that there are legal consequences of this provision:
  - (1) the formation of "nominating committee" should cover extensively different sectors and professions in society;
  - (2) the contenders need to be nominated by the "nominating committee" itself. Nominations by members of some sectors under the committee is not on par with nomination "a broadly by representative" nominating committee.
- Article 45 clearly stipulates that the nominating committee should make its nomination in accordance with democratic procedure. It should be noted that the emphasis of such "procedure" lays on "openness", "fairness" and "equality".
- Support using democratic method to select the CE, but, "one-person-one-vote" may not be the most suitable option.
  - In the future, it is unavoidable that the electorate base for the CE election has

Mr Henry WOO

8.6.2007

Organizations/individualsDate ofmaking the submissionsSubmission

Summary of Views

to be expanded. It is a reasonable strategy if the development is properly managed.

## Annex II

# Public views on possible models for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage

### Written submissions received by the Legislative Council

Organizations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
Hong Kong Bar Association (Submission No. 03 in Appendix I to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05- 06(01))	3.3.2000	All members of the Election Committee shall be returned by direct or indirect election; at least half of the members of the Election Committee be returned by geographical constituency election by universal suffrage.
Hong Kong University Graduates Association Political Reform Concern Group (Submission No. 04 in Appendix I to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05- 06(01))	9.2004	<ul> <li>To transform the 800-member Election Committee into a 1200-member nominating committee. The method for electing members should be similar to that of the existing Election Committee.</li> <li>A CE candidate should be jointly nominated by not less than 150, but not more than 200 members of the nominating committee (with not less than 25 members from each sector). Each member may nominate only one</li> </ul>
		<ul> <li>candidate.</li> <li>Election of the CE by universal suffrage will be held after nomination. As regards the election and vote counting methods, consideration should be given to requiring a candidate to secure more than half of the valid votes in order to</li> </ul>

Organizations/individuals	
making the submissions	
(Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	

Date of <u>Submission</u>

15.2.2005

Summary of Views

be elected.

Civic Exchange (Submission No. 01 in Appendix I to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01)) • The Election Committee to be composed of not less than 5 000 members and be changed into a nominating committee.

- As regards the composition of the nominating committee, apart from the ex-officio members (such as the Legislative Council Members, Hong Kong Deputies to the National People's Congress and representatives of Hong Kong members of the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference), the other members may be selected at random based on each of the District Council constituency.
- A candidate needs to secure nominations from not less than 250 members of the nominating committee and 2 500 registered voters in order to be qualified to stand at election.

9.11.2005 The Chief Executive should be elected by direct election on a "one-person-one-vote" basis. No need to establish any form of election committee.

Association for the Advancement of Feminism (Submission No. 14 in Appendix I to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01))

Organizations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung (Submission No. 13 in Appendix I to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05- 06(01))	16.1.2006	It is inappropriate to retain the nominating committee for the selection of the CE. A candidate can only be nominated when he has secured support from a specified percentage of registered voters. The nomination and election proceedings should adhere to the principle of "one-person-one-vote".
Democratic Party (Submission No. 02 in Appendix I to LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05- 06(01))	4.2006	The nominating committee to be formed by the Members of the LegCo. The CE should then be elected by members of the public on a "one-person-one-vote" basis and appointed by the CPG. A CE candidate is to be nominated by five LegCo Members. Each Member may nominate only one candidate.
Hon CHEUNG Man-Kwong (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1022/06-07)	18.12.2006	The Government should make reference to the "dual nomination system" as practised by other countries, under which candidates may either be nominated by a nominating committee or by the public if they could enlist a certain percentage of public support. Aspiring candidates who are able to secure nominations from 5% of voters should be eligible to stand for the CE election.
The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1873/06-07(11))	9.5.2007	• Constitutional development should be pursued without invoking a constitutional crisis and amending the Basic Law.

• The model for universal suffrage should comply with the provisions of the Basic Law and four principles on

Organizations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	Date of Submission	Summary of Views
		constitutional development, namely (1) meeting the interests of different sectors of society; (2) facilitating the development of the capitalist economy; (3) gradual and orderly progress; and (4) appropriate to the actual situation in Hong Kong.
League of Social Democrats (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1873/06-07(09))	11.5.2007	• To abolish the existing Election Committee. Any eligible resident, who can secure a certain number of nominations from, say 50,000, eligible electors (with signatures) is qualified for CE candidacy. A CE election on the basis of one-person-one-vote will be held, and the one who obtains the "absolute majority" of votes will be returned as the CE.
		• By "absolute majority", the CE elect is required to secure more than 50% of votes. If no one receives a "absolute majority" of votes in the first round of voting, then the two candidates with the highest number of votes in the first round will enter into the second round.
Mr LEUNG Siu-tong (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1873/06-07(10))	11.5.2007	• The CE election in 2012 may involve two stages. First of all, CE candidates are to be returned by a Election Committee election. After that all residents of Hong Kong will vote on the eligible CE candidates thus returned on a one-person-one-vote basis. If there is only one candidate, consideration should be given to requiring him to obtain 40% of the

Organizations/individuals <u>making the submissions</u> (Submission No.<sup>Note</sup>) Summary of Views

Date of Submission

vote of confidence in order to get elected.

- Election • Membership of the Committee should be enlarged to 1800. The delineation of sectors under the Committee should also be readjusted, with 600 members from industrial, commercial and financial sectors and professions sectors, 600 from labour, social services and religious sectors, 600 from LegCo members, DC members, Hong Kong NPC and deputies the to representatives of Hong Kong members of the CPPCC.
- The nomination threshold should be set at 1/5 of the Election Committee members. That is to say, a person has to secure nominations from 360 eligible members in order to be qualified for candidacy.
- If the threshold is set at 1/10 (ie. 180) of the Election Committee members, then candidates must secure nominations from at least 1/10 of the members from each of the three sectors mentioned above, in order to fulfill the purpose of balanced participation.
- Professions like pre-school education, Chinese medicine, mass media, security services and beauty consultancy should take up a number

Organizations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		of seats in the Election Committee.
Ms YUNG Wing-sheung, Amy (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1873/06-07(02))	15.5.2007	• Agree with the proposal of converting the existing Election Committee into a nominating committee. The electorate base of each sector under the Committee should be enlarged.
		• The proposal on the inclusion of elected DC members in the nominating committee, which will help promoting the representativeness and credibility of the Committee, is worthy of consideration.
		• Nomination threshold for CE election should be adjusted downward. It should be lower than the existing threshold of 12.5%, regardless of the formation and size of the Committee. The aim of which is to ensure that aspiring contenders will not be banned from running in CE election and more choices are offered to residents of Hong Kong.
Liberal Party (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1873/06-07(13))	15.5.2007	• If the relevant conditions have ripened into maturity, the election of CE by universal suffrage could be implemented hopefully by 2012. Such "conditions" include the nomination of CE candidates for election by universal suffrage by a broadly representative nominating committee and the rationalized relationship between the ExCo and LegCo.

Organizations/individuals <u>making the submissions</u> (Submission No.<sup>Note</sup>) Date of Submission Summary of Views

- The existing Election Committee may be converted into a nominating committee. The number of members could be increased to 1200 or 1600, so as to enhance the legitimacy and representativeness of the nominating committee. At the same time. consideration should be given to the principle of balanced participation, as well as attainment of balance between sectoral interests and overall interests. The number of seats of the current four sectors should be increased evenly and the ratio of membership among sectors should not be changed in a slipshod manner.
- Nomination threshold for the first CE election by universal suffrage should not be too low, on the contrary, it is appropriate and prudent to set the threshold at a relatively high level. In subsequent elections, the threshold may be lowered gradually in the light of the actual situation of Hong Kong.
- Nominations secured by a candidate should come from the four sectors in order to reflect the principle of balanced participation as set out in the Basic Law.
- Early implementation of universal suffrage in CE election is subject to the fulfillment of some essential and related requirements, such as the improvement of the relationship

Organizations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		between the executive authorities and the legislature.
The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1910/06-07(01))	17.5.2007	• Propose that the composition and electoral method should be modelled on that for the existing Election Committee. Membership of 800 should remain unchanged.
		• Propose that nominating committee members should select, by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote, not more than three CE candidates from all who have secured signature support from 100 or more members. Nominating committee members select the CE candidates on the basis of one-person-one-vote by simple majority voting method.
		• The CE should be returned by universal suffrage on the basis of one-person-one-vote. Among the CE candidates (not more than three), the one who obtains the highest number of valid votes cast will be returned as the CE elect, who will then be officially appointed by the CPG as the CE.
Civic Association (LC Paper No. CB(2)1910-06/07(02))	18.5.2007	• Set up a 800-member nominating committee in 2012. The nominating committee will nominate a list of CE candidates and the voters will elect the CE by one-person-one-vote.

Organizations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
The Frontier	19.5.2007	• Before the Basic Law can be amended, the nominating committee under Article 45 should be formed by election on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
		• The threshold for nominating candidates should not be too high, the nomination mechanism should not be used to prevent those holding dissenting views from participating in the election.
Civil Human Rights Front	20.5.2007	• Given a mature government, well-developed supporting electoral measures and wide public participation in the election, it is believed that Hong Kong people are provided with the required conditions and rights to elect the CE and all LegCo Members of the HKSAR on the basis of "one person, one vote" so as to truly implement the accountability system.
Concern Group on Hong Kong's Future	21.5.2007	• There should be a low threshold, without a screening process or exercise in nomination, so as to protect the purity of democracy.
		• Before the nominating committee can be abolished, the nominating committee in 2012 should be formed by 1200 members, which comprise 800 Election Committee member and about 400 elected DC members. 50 members from any sectors may nominate one CE candidate. A CE will

Organizations/individuals making the submissions (Submission No. <sup>Note</sup> )	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views
		then be elected by members of the public on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
The Democratic Party (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1873/06-07(08))	5.2007	• Before the Basic Law amendment on abolishing the nominating committee can be made, the nominating committee in 2012 should be formed by about 1200 members, comprising 800 Election Committee members and about 400 elected DC members.
		• 50 members from any sectors may nominate one CE candidate. A CE will then be elected by members of the public on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
Asia-Pacific Institute of International Relations (LC Paper No. CB(2) 1873/06-07(12))	5.2007	• In the 2012 CE election, the existing 800-member Election Committee should turn into a nominating committee. A person who secures nominations from 100 members will be qualified for candidacy. All eligible voters of Hong Kong will then elect a CE by one-person-one-vote for the appointment by the Central Government. Annex I to the Basic Law should be amended.
		• In 2017, the number of the nominating committee member should increase from 800 to 1600. The newly added 800 members are returned from the eight constituencies by one-person-one-vote. A person who secures nomination from 200 members will be qualified for candidacy. All

Organizations/individuals <u>making the submissions</u> (Submission No.<sup>Note</sup>)

Date of Submission Summary of Views

eligible voters of Hong Kong will then elect a CE by one-person-one-vote for the appointment by the Central Government. Annex I to the Basic Law should be amended.

- In 2022, the nominating committee should be formed by 1600 members who are all returned from the eight constituencies by one-person-one-vote. A person who secures nomination from 200 members will be qualified for candidacy. All eligible voters of Hong Kong will then elect a CE by one-person-one-vote for the the appointment by Central Government. Annex I to the Basic Law should be amended.
- Note: Please refer to the Legislative Council webpage for the original text of the submissions (LC Paper No. CB(2)2386/05-06(01)). (www.legco.gov.hk/yr05-06/english/panels/ca/papers/ca0619cb2-2386-1e.p df)

63

#### Views on possible models for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage

#### Written submissions received by the Committee on Governance and Political Development of the Commission on Strategic Development

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan	9.1.2006	• The composition of the nominating committee must realize the principle of universal and equal rights for all citizens to nominate and be nominated. The current composition of the Election Committee stipulated in Annex I to the Basic Law is obviously not in line with the principle of equal and universal rights. It will not be consistent with the provisions of "democratic procedures" and "ultimate aim of universal suffrage" stipulated in Article 45 if such a composition is taken as a blueprint for forming the nominating committee.
		• Regarding the voting method for electing the CE by universal suffrage, it is necessary to consider whether to adopt a "simple majority" voting method or a "two-round polling system" (i.e. if no candidate obtains more than half of the valid votes cast in the first round of polling, a second round will be held for voters to elect the CE between the two candidates obtaining the most votes in the first round).

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
Mr CHAN Chung-bun, Bunny	20.1.2006	To expand considerably the membership of the Election Committee (including all District Council members as originally proposed by the Government).
Hon LEE Wing-tat	26.5.2006	• The nominating committee should be composed of the Members of LegCo, and the CE should be elected on a "one-person-one-vote" basis.
		• A CE candidate may be nominated by five LegCo Members. Each Member may nominate only one candidate. As such, the number of candidates will be capped at 12.
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan	7.2006	• It will not be consistent with the principle of democratic election and the provisions of Article 45 of the Basic Law if the Election Committee is used as a basis for forming the nominating committee.
		• Political parties or groups with certain representativeness (or alliances formed by political parties / groups) may recommend a contender to the nominating committee to stand for the CE election.
		• 50 000 (or 100 000) registered voters may also jointly recommend a contender to the nominating committee to stand for election.
		• Even if a contender is recommended by political parties/groups, he should not

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views Note
		be considered as a nominee for the election. He will become a formal candidate for the CE election only after the recommendation is validated by the nominating committee.
		• Regarding the voting method for electing the CE by universal suffrage, it is necessary to consider whether to adopt a "simple majority" voting method or a "two-round system" (i.e. if no candidate obtains more than half of the valid votes cast in the first round of polling, a second round will be held for voters to elect the CE among the two candidates who have received the highest number of votes in the first round).
Mr TAM Kwok-kiu	19.7.2006	Option 1:
		• To transform the existing Election Committee into a nominating committee. To expand the number of members from the present 800 to 3 200;

- The electorate base of the nominating committee should be expanded to cover all eligible voters in Hong Kong;
- Certain sectors should be added or removed, and some should have its composition adjusted to reflect the relative importance of these sectors in the community;

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>

Date of <u>Submission</u> Summary of Views Note

- Each voter should be assigned to one of the sectors according to the new delineation, and should have the right to vote and stand for election in the respective sector;
- The number of seats allocated to the respective sectors in the nominating committee should be proportionate to their population size;
- To abolish corporate voting;
- A CE candidate should be required to secure nominations from at least 5% of the members of the nominating committee. Each member of the nominating committee may nominate only one candidate;
- The number of candidates should be limited to 10. Candidates will be ranked according to the number of nominations they received. The 10 people who received the highest number of nominations will be qualified for formal candidacy; and
- A CE should be returned by universal suffrage on the basis of "one-person-one vote" by a "simple majority voting method". The CE elect will become the CE of the SAR upon appointment by the Central People's Government.

Members Submitting Views

Date of Submission Summary of Views Note

#### Option 2:

- The future nominating committee should be formed by all 60 Members of the LegCo;
- Only those who have secured nominations from 10% of the Members of the LegCo (i.e. 6 Members) should formally become a candidate in the CE election. Each LegCo Member may nominate only one candidate, thus limiting the number of candidates to 10; and
- A CE should be returned by universal suffrage on the basis of "one-person-one vote" by a "simple majority voting method". The CE elect will become the CE of the SAR upon appointment by the Central People's Government.
- To use the Election Committee as a basis and to maintain the four sectors, namely the industrial and commercial, the professions, grassroots and political sectors, each taking up one-fourth of the seats.
  - The nomination threshold should not be too low, as this will lead to too many candidates with mixed quality standing for election.
  - It is more appropriate to first focus on discussing the operation of the

Miss Maria TAM Wai-chu 28.7.2006

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		first-term nominating committee. The nomination method of the subsequent terms should be improved gradually in future.
		• For electing the CE by universal suffrage for the first time, the nomination threshold should be set at 25% of all members of the nominating committee. In principle, there should be no more than four candidates.
		• Apart from receiving the required number of subscribers, candidates should also have the support of at least one-fourth of all Members of the LegCo and one-fourth of the Hong Kong deputies to the NPC.
Mr YU Kwok-chun	28.7.2006	• The existing Election Committee should serve as a blueprint for forming the nominating committee, with adjustments made as appropriate.
		• All Hong Kong members of the CPPCC should be included in the nominating committee.
		• For the election of the first CE by universal suffrage, the nomination threshold should be set at 25% of members of the nominating committee.

• Following nomination, the CE will be returned by universal suffrage.

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
Mr NG Sze-fuk, George	28.7.2006	• The Election Committee should serve as the blueprint for forming the nominating committee.
		• The number of members of the nominating committee could be modeled on that of the Election Committee, and be adjusted appropriately in the light of the actual situation in Hong Kong and public views.
		• The number of candidates should be limited to four. A preliminary selection mechanism should be set up to enable aspiring candidates to pass a lower threshold. For example, contenders who are able to secure 100 supporting signatures from the 800-strong nominating committee will undergo the preliminary selection mechanism. Members of the nominating committee may cast a maximum of four votes by secret ballot and those four contenders receiving the highest number of votes will become CE candidates.
Hon SHEK Lai-him, Abraham	28.7.2006	• The composition of the nominating committee should model on the four sectors of the existing Election Committee. On this basis, corresponding adjustments could be made e.g. to increase the number of members from the business sector to encourage greater participation of the sector in the process.

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>

Date of Submission Summary of Views Note

- The number of members of the nominating committee should double that of the existing Election Committee, amounting to 1 600.
- All new seats should be allocated to the existing four sectors, with more seats for members from the business sector. The proportion of members from the industrial, commercial and financial sectors should be increased from the current 25% to 35% to reflect the sectors' commitment to and influence on the Hong Kong community.
- The nomination threshold should be increased from the current 12.5% to 25%.
- There should not be any upper limit on the number of subscribers required for nomination.
- Each member of the nominating committee may nominate only one candidate.
- The CE should be elected by all eligible voters in Hong Kong on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
- Abolition of corporate voting will hamper the participation of the business sector and undermine the confidence of investors in Hong Kong. It is not in line with the fundamental interests of Hong Kong.

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
Mr CHAU How-chen	28.7.2006	• The existing Election Committee should be taken as a blueprint for forming the nominating committee.
		• The number of members of the nominating committee should be increased to 1 600, of which different strata and major sectors of the community should be included.
		• A relatively higher nomination threshold for candidates should be set to ensure that they are capable of soliciting support from different sectors of society.
		• Each candidate should receive at least 400 nominations. Each member of the nominating committee can only nominate one candidate.
		• There should be an upper limit for the number of subscribers, say 50% of the members of the nominating committee. There will be two to four candidates under such a nomination mechanism.
		• In addition, each candidate should also secure supporting signatures from not less than 5 000 registered voters. Each registered voter may sign up to support one candidate.
		• The particulars of candidates should be submitted to the Central Government for the record. The CE will then by returned by universal suffrage on the

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		basis of one-person-one-vote by secret ballot, using the simple majority voting method. There is no need to set up a threshold for the percentage of votes to be received by the winning candidate. The candidate who receives the highest number of votes will be elected for appointment by the Central Government in accordance with the Basic Law.
Mr SZE Chin-hung, Jerome	31.7.2006	• In forming a "broadly representative" nominating committee, the following three areas should be considered:
		<ol> <li>to carefully examine whether the existing 38 subsectors of the Election Committee are sufficiently broadly representative;</li> </ol>
		(2) all Hong Kong members of the CPPCC should become members of the nominating committee;
		(3) in principle, it is reasonable to have a nominating committee larger than the Election Committee. It will be conducive to allowing contenders from different sectors to secure nominations by expanding the number and size of the subsectors.
		• The nomination threshold should allow no less than six candidates to get nominated.
		• The nominating committee can exercise a veto power. Any contender

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		who is vetoed by 50% or more of the members will automatically lose his eligibility for nomination.
Mr LAU Nai-keung	1.8.2006	• The nominating committee should comprise about 1 500 members:
		<u>The first sector</u> 200 members from the business sectors. Corporate voting should be abolished.
		<u>The second sector</u> 200 members from the professions. Corporate voting should be abolished.
		<u>The third sector</u> 200 members from education and social welfare sectors. Corporate voting should be abolished.
		<u>The fourth sector</u> Around 200 members representing the establishment of the Central Authorities, including the deputies to the NPC and members of the CPPCC.
		<u>The fifth sector</u> Around 200 ex-officio members representing the establishment of the HKSAR, including the CE, members of the Executive Council, all Members of the LegCo, as well as chairpersons of standing advisory bodies.
		<u>The sixth sector</u> Around 500 ex-officio members representing the district organizations,

Summary of Views<sup>Note</sup>

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>

Date of Submission

including all elected DC members.

- The nominating committee is highly representative of the population since all elected DC members are included. There is no need to consider adding other functional sectors such as housewives.
- Contenders should be required to • receive nominations from not less than 10% (about 150 members) and not more than 30% (about 450 members) of the members of the nominating committee. They should also obtain nominations from not less than 10% of the members in each of the sectors (about 20 from each of the first five sectors, and 50 from the  $6^{th}$  sector) to formally become a CE candidate. Each member of the nominating committee may nominate one candidate, and the nominations should be made public and on record.
- Universal suffrage should be held four months before the current term of the office of the CE expires. The new CE should be elected by all eligible and registered electors on the basis of one-person-one-vote by secret ballot.
- Polling should still be held even if there is only one candidate. The candidate must receive more than half of the votes cast before being put forth for appointment by the Central Government. The election will become

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		invalid if the candidate fails to receive more than half of the votes. A fresh round of nomination and election should be held within two months. The proceedings will continue until a new CE is elected.
		• If none of the candidates is able to receive more than half of the votes cast, the two candidates with the highest number of votes will contest the second round of election which should be held within two weeks. The candidate who receives more than half of the votes will be elected and put forth for appointment by the Central Government.
Ms KO Po-ling	30.8.2006	• The nominating committee should comprise 1 600 members from different sectors.
		• Those who stand for the CE election must receive nominations from 50 or more members of the nominating committee. Among the nominations, five should be from LegCo Members and five from the Hong Kong deputies to the NPC.
		• Contenders should go through preliminary selection procedures. Each member of the nominating committee can select two contenders. The two contenders having the highest number of votes will become CE candidates. All eligible electors in Hong Kong may cast their votes on the

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission		Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
			basis of one-person-one-vote. The candidate who receives more than 50% of the valid votes cast will be elected and put forth for appointment by the Central People's Government.
Mr CHAN Chung-bun, Bunny	31.8.2006	•	The Election Committee should be taken as a blueprint, but the number of members should be increased. The 800-member Election Committee comprises four sectors (each with 200 members). These four sectors should be maintained, while the number of members of each sector should be increased to 300 (i.e. the nominating committee will have 1 200 members).
		•	Each candidate must receive nominations from at least 240 (i.e. 20%) members of the nominating committee (if the total membership of the committee is increased to 1 200).
		•	Each member of the nominating committee may nominate only one candidate.
		•	The number of subscriptions obtained by a candidate should be capped at half of the total membership of the nominating committee.
		•	Under the executive-led principle, it is important that a candidate will be elected as the CE only if he obtains more than half of the votes cast.

Hon LEE Wing-tat

Date of Submission Summary of Views Note

## Option 1:

Candidates who receive the smallest number of votes will be eliminated first. Polling arrangements will then be made for voters to elect from among the remaining candidates. After one or more rounds of elections, there will finally be two candidates left. The candidate who secures more than half of the votes cast will become the CE.

## Option 2:

To limit the number of candidates standing for the election by universal suffrage. Only the two candidates receiving the highest number of nominations should appear on the list. The candidate so returned must have received more than half of the votes cast.

- 9.2006 The nominating committee should be formed by LegCo Members for nominating CE candidates, who will then be elected by universal suffrage on the basis of one-person-one-vote.
  - A lower nomination threshold should be set - five LegCo Members may jointly nominate a candidate to stand for election.
- Mr SZE Chin-hung, 5.9.2006 There are two requirements for Jerome • There are two requirements for nomination under the Basic Law nomination by a "broadly representative" nominating committee

Members Submitting Views

Date of <u>Submission</u>

"in accordance with democratic procedures".

The first requirement is to admit individuals who are "broadly representative" into the nominating committee so that they can nominate aspiring contenders in their personal capacity.

The second requirement is that the committee as a whole will nominate "formal" candidates "in accordance with democratic procedures". Those who have received the prescribed number of subscription should undergo a "veto or confidence voting" by all members of the committee "in with accordance democratic procedures". A member may indicate on the nomination list the candidates whom they have no confidence on. Any nominees who are "vetoed" by 50% or more of the members will lose their eligibility in running the election.

Hon TIEN Pei-chun, James 8.9.2006

- Provided that favorable conditions are available (e.g. with good coordination in political work), 2012 could be the earliest possible date for implementing universal suffrage for the CE election.
  - Before implementing universal suffrage for the CE election, it is necessary to enhance cooperation between the executive authorities and the legislature. In this regard, the formation of a governing coalition can ensure that

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		government policies will have regular and sufficient support in the LegCo.
Mr WONG Ying-ho, Kennedy	14.9.2006	• In regard to the election of the CE by universal suffrage for the first time, consideration can be given to transforming the Election Committee into a nominating committee in accordance with the existing method for forming the Election Committee. The membership of 800 should remain unchanged.
		• The composition of some trades may have undergone major changes, with some new sectors keep emerging. Suitable adjustments should be made in the light of the actual situation, but such adjustments should not deviate from the guiding principles stipulated in the Basic Law (i.e. each sector to take up one-fourth of the membership of the nominating committee).
		• The operation of the nominating committee can be divided into two stages:
		Stage 1: Aspiring contenders should first receive supporting signatures from 100 (or more) members of the nominating committee, with at least 25 signatures from each of the four sectors. Each member of the committee may support eight candidates at most.
		Stage 2: The 800 members of the nominating committee should select

Summary of Views<sup>Note</sup>

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>

Date of <u>Submission</u>

> candidates by secret ballot. It should be prescribed in the Chief Executive Election Ordinance that the maximum number of candidates is three. The number of votes to be cast by nominating committee members will be determined by the number of contenders, with a maximum of three.

- If there are more than three contenders, each member of the nominating committee may cast three votes to nominate three nominees. If there are only three contenders, each member may cast two votes. The contenders who secure more than half (i.e. more than 400 votes) of the votes will be selected as CE candidates.
- If there are only two contenders, the abovementioned voting procedures should take place to return candidates. If there is only one contender, members should cast a vote of confidence in accordance with the above procedures and the contender should not be selected as candidate automatically.
- To take the first and the subsequent two elections of the CE by universal suffrage as a pilot scheme. A review should be conducted to formulate a long term electoral method thereafter.
  - During the pilot period, the electoral method for electing the CE by universal suffrage can be carried out in 3 stages:

Ms CHOW, Wendy

18.9.2006

Date of <u>Submission</u> Summary of Views Note

## Stage 1

To transform the Election Committee to a nominating committee. The number of members should remain unchanged.

The nomination threshold should be raised to 20%.

If there are more than two eligible CE candidates, the CE will be elected by eligible registered voters on the basis of one-person-one-vote through two rounds of elections.

## Stage 2

The original four sectors should be maintained, but a fifth sector (comprising 200 members who are directly elected by all eligible voters from different districts on the basis of one-person-one-vote) will be added.

Voters may choose to vote in one of the five sectors to which they are qualified to vote. Corporate voting should be abolished.

Candidates will be required to receive nominations from not less than 20% of members in each of the sectors. Among the nominations, at least 10% should come from Hong Kong deputies to the NPC and Hong Kong members of the CPPCC.

The voting method will be the same as that in stage 1.

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		<u>Stage 3</u> The membership of the fifth sector (directly elected members) should increase from 200 to 400.
		• Nomination and voting methods are the same as those in stage 2.
		• The electoral system should be reviewed after completion of the third election of the CE by universal suffrage.
Dr LEUNG Mei-fun, 22 Priscilla	22.9.2006	• The number of the nominating committee members should increase to 1 600. Making reference to the existing method for forming the Election Committee, the nominating committee should comprise the original four sectors, with the membership in each sector doubled and returned through either election or consultations.
		• The nominating committee may subsequently be further expanded and returned by universal suffrage.
		• Contenders must receive at least 300 nominations. Eligible candidates will be elected by all voters in Hong Kong on the basis of one-person-one-vote.

• The Registration and Electoral Office of Hong Kong should submit the names of candidates who have received sufficient nominations to the Central Government. Verification of their

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of <u>Submission</u>		Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
			eligibility will be conducted by the Hong Kong and Macao Affairs Office of the State Council, which is a department directly under the Central Government.
		•	Upon verification of the eligibility of candidates, election by universal suffrage can be conducted. The CE elected by universal suffrage can be appointed by the Central Government in a smooth manner.
Mr SZE Chin-hung, Jerome	3.10.2006	•	Before universal suffrage can be implemented in Hong Kong, a mechanism for the nominating committee to carry out preliminary screening should be established. This is to allow patriots with the capability to govern Hong Kong to stand for election.
		•	Membership of the nominating committee should be 1 200.
		•	The nomination procedures should involve two steps:
			<ul> <li>(1) Each member of the nominating committee may nominate one potential candidate, who must receive support from 150 (12.5%) members of the nominating committee.</li> </ul>
			(2) After potential candidates are put forth, all members of the nominating committee should
	8	4	

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		exercise their veto power to vote down those who fail to meet the requirements (i.e. candidates should have the capability to govern Hong Kong and should be patriotic). Potential candidates who are vetoed by more than half of the members would lose their eligibility as candidates.
Ms FONG, Janie	6.10.2006	• The nominating committee should comprise 800 to 1 600 members.
		• The nomination threshold should be set at 12.5% to 25% of the membership.
		• Each member may nominate only one candidate.
		• Simple majority voting method should be used.
Mr LIE-A-CHEONG Tai-chong, David	23.11.2006	• A consensus should first be reached on the constitutional development proposals put forth by the Government in 2005. On this basis, the existing Election Committee should be expanded. In addition to the current 800 members, consideration could be given to including all DC members and HK members of the CPPCC. Those from sectors which are not yet included could also be included as appropriate. The size of the Election Committee should not exceed 1600.

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		• The Election Committee is only a transitional arrangement, which should be improved through operation. Ultimately, it could turn into a nominating committee when universal suffrage for CE is attained.
Dr LEUNG Mei-fun, Priscilla	23.11.2006	• The Central Authorities and Hong Kong will face a great political crisis if candidates returned by universal suffrage are in the end not appointed by the Central Authorities.
		• A simple and forthright approach is to allow the Central Authorities to participate directly in the candidate selection process.
		• If the proposal of allowing the Central Authorities to verify the eligibility of candidates could hardly be accepted, consideration may be given to forming a committee. Selection of members and composition of the committee could further be examined (participation of Hong Kong people in the committee should not be ruled out).
		• The function of this committee is mainly to verify the eligibility of candidates. The size of the committee should not be too big. Its role is to verify eligibility of candidates, rather than nominating candidates.

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of <u>Submission</u>	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
Mr SHIH Wing-ching	7.3.2007 & 8.3.2007	• The role of Election Committee should first be changed from selecting the CE to selecting CE candidates for universal suffrage.
		• Hong Kong deputies to the National People's Congress and Hong Kong members of the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference could be ex-official members. Other members should mainly come from the functional constituencies.
		• The nomination threshold could be lowered to require 30 subscribers, so that more people could participate. The Election Committee should elect three "formal" candidates for universal suffrage.
Mr SZE Chin-ming, Jerome	10.4.2007	• Support the establishment of a nominating committee, whose members will exercise negative voting on those who are qualified for formal candidacy.
Mr WONG Kong-hon	10.4.2007	• There should be balanced participation of all social strata in the nominating committee, including people of Hong Kong who are serving in the establishment of the Central Authorities, such as Hong Kong deputies to the NPC and Hong Kong members of the CPPCC.
Miss TAM Wai-chu, Maria	11.4.2007	• It is not appropriate to form the nominating committee by LegCo members.

Date of Submission Summary of Views Note

- In formulating the electoral method for selecting CE, "local" people, who are experienced in dealing with the affairs of the Central Government, should actively play the role of a bridge in local consultation or nomination process. As Hong Kong deputies to the NPC are members of the legislature under the Central Government who abide by the national constitution and laws (including the Basic Law), they are well qualified in helping the SAR Government in the implementation of constitution and law. They are a minority in Hong Kong, who have the firsthand knowledge on the operation of "One Country, Two Systems" both in Hong Kong and the Mainland.
- composition of the Election The Committee may serve as a blueprint of the nominating committee. It is appropriate to maintain the current composition industrial of and professions. commercial sectors. grassroots and political sectors, with each taking up 1/4 seats.
- Membership of the nominating committee may be maintained at 800.
- If universal suffrage is to be implementing in CE election, the nomination threshold should be set at a higher level. The nomination method of the first and second elections by universal suffrage should be dealt with first and improvements be made after

Members Submitting Views

Date of Submission Summary of Views Note

conclusion of experience. The nomination threshold should not be too low as this will lead to too many candidates with mixed quality standing for election and also many rounds of voting or counting before a CE can be returned.

• The basic principle of nomination is that there should not be more than four candidates. If the nominating committee comprises 800 members, then the nomination threshold should be set as 25%, i.e. each candidate should obtain nominations from not less than 200 members, with 50 nominations from four each of the sectors. The nominations thus secured should also include those from at least 1/4 of the LegCo members (1/4 of 60 is 15) and 1/4 of representatives of Hong Kong members of the CPPCC (that is 9).

- The Hon SHEK Lai-him, Abraham
- 12.4.2007
- Composition of the nominating committee should be modelled on the 800-member Election Committee. The CE candidates should obtain 200 nominations, instead of the present 100, in order to be qualified for standing for election. The requirement that each member may nominate only one candidate should be maintained.
  - Election of CE by universal suffrage should be implemented before that of the LegCo.

Members Submitting Views

Date of Submission

12.4.2007

Summary of Views Note

- To enhance the representativeness of the nominating committee. future its membership may be increased to 1200 or 1600, but corresponding adjustments should be made on the basis of the four the sectors of existing Election Committee. For example, the proportion of industrial and commercial, financial services sectors should be increased to 35%.
- The nomination threshold should be raised from the present 12.5% to 25%.
- There should only be one round of election, in which the candidate do not necessarily have to secure more than half of the valid votes in order to be returned as CE.
- Voting should be held even if there is only one candidate.
- Support the composition of the nominating committee basing on that of Committee. Election The four the of the Election sectors current Committee may serve as a reference. The nominating committee should be formed by 800 members.
- On nomination threshold, it should be set at 20% (ie 160 members) or 25% (ie 200 members) of the total membership of the nominating committee, ensuring that the candidate has the quality of a CE and the election is a contested one.

Mr NG Sze-fuk, George

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views <sup>Note</sup>
		• Only one round of voting should be conducted, in which the candidate do not necessarily have to secure more than half of the valid votes. In order to display the spirit of universal suffrage, voting should be held even if there is only one candidate.
		• Agree to proceed in the direction of "universal suffrage for the CE preceding that for LegCo".
Dr LEUNG Mei-fun, Priscilla	12.4.2007	<ul> <li>According to the Basic Law, the electoral method for selecting CE is mainly divided into 3 levels:</li> <li>(1) election by universal suffrage</li> <li>(2) nomination by the elite</li> <li>(3) appointment by the Central Government.</li> </ul>
		• Any proposal for early implementation of universal suffrage for CE election has to meet these requirements. Hong Kong should recognize that the Central Government has a right in deciding any proposal on political reform. In formulating any proposal, Hong Kong in fact should invite the Central Government to participate in the discussion and express their opinion. This will be beneficial to the smooth formulation of proposal.
Dr LEUNG Mei-fun, Priscilla, Prof CHENG Kwok-hon, Leonard, Mr Chang Chak-yan	10.5.2007	• On the issue of universal suffrage, including the composition of nominating committee and nomination threshold for electing the CE, the problem will not be resolved if no compromise can be

Members Submitting <u>Views</u>	Date of Submission	Summary of Views Note
		reached among different parties. A model with lower nomination threshold, without any screening process and will ensure the property of the Central Authorities should be attained. Under such circumstances, Hong Kong has to:
		<ol> <li>formulate the local legislation on Article 23 performing our duty under the Basic Law;</li> <li>amend the Chief Executive Election Ordinance in order to ensure the right to appoint the CE by the Central Authorities;</li> <li>formulate the political party law so as to regulate the development of political parties.</li> </ol>
Dr ZHOU Ba-jun	8.5.2007 15.5.2007 22.5.2007 29.5.2007	• At present, the biggest difficulty in the formulation of a model for selecting CE by universal suffrage lies in the composition of the nominating committee and the nomination "threshold" for the CE candidates. The deep-level conflict behind include the unresolved conflicts between "Two Systems" and "One Country" within the political environment of Hong Kong, and the insufficient mutual trust between the society of Hong Kong and the Central Government.
		• The development of a democratic political system according to the concept of "one country, two systems" is a ground-breaking attempt without any successful precedents. Apart from the requisites elaborated in the textbooks

Date of <u>Submission</u>

> and writings on politics published in the western countries, certain fundamentals are required to promote the development of a democratic political system under "two systems" within the framework of "one country".

- Common values developed from the principle of "One Country, Two System" between Hong Kong and the Central Authorities and among the various political factions within Hong Kong are pertinent to universal suffrage in Hong Kong "achieved when the conditions are ripe" and "accomplished naturally with ease" and the long-term stability and prosperity of Hong Kong. That will be the "sustainable" democratic political system.
- The constitutional development of Hong Kong is now confronted with a severe predicament - to implement universal suffrage under a not yet well-developed environment or to establish a common value that meets the requirement of "One Country, Two Systems" among the society of Hong Kong, the Central Government and different political parties in Hong Kong. The society of Hong Kong should make a prudent choice in this regard.
- Note: Please refer to the Central Policy Unit webpage ("Committee on Governance and Political Development – Members' views on strategic issues discussed outside committee meetings") for the original text of the submissions. (www.cpu.gov.hk/english/csd\_gc\_submissions.htm)